



**GULF OF THE FARALLONES NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY (GFNMS)  
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING**

Half Moon Bay Yacht Club  
Half Moon Bay, CA  
9:15AM – 3:30 PM  
Thursday November 8, 2012

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

**CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, REVIEW AGENDA**

***Copies to:***

Bill Douros                      ONMS West Coast Regional Office

Dominique Richard called the meeting to order at 9:42 am

**Review Agenda**

Due to sickness Maria Brown presented on behalf of Benet Duncan and Jan Roletto presented for Karen Reyna

**Superintendent's Report:**

Staff introductions

Swearing in of new member, Anne Morkill, representing USFWS.

***Budget-***

We are currently in a continuing resolution which means that the Sanctuary will continue working with the existing budget we had last year.

***Permits-***

Two permits have been received since the last permitting report. A research permit was denied to Neel Lilani for a one day white shark color preference study conducted in the waters around the Farallon Islands. An education permit was issued to Randy Kochevar for a documentary film project associated with permitted research conducted under MULTI-2009-005 (issued to Barbara Block), to be conducted in the waters around the Farallon Islands and Año Nuevo. Additionally, two permit requests are currently under review. The first is a request from Sean Van Sommeran for the tagging, photo documentation, and biopsy sampling of both white sharks and basking sharks throughout the Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary and around the waters of Año Nuevo. The second permit under review is requested by Gerry McChesney from the US Fish and Wildlife Service to conduct hazing trials of western gulls around the waters of the Farallon Island and over the islands using different types of aerial craft (AUV's, helicopters) to help the USFWS develop a house mouse eradication program.



### *Northern Expansion Update-*

Congresswoman Lynn Woolsey has met with Dr. Lubchenco and CEQ strongly urging protection of the northern expansion area. Congresswoman Woolsey sent a letter to the President on September 28, 2012 requesting he create a marine monument that included the expanded boundaries of GFNMS and CBNMS stipulated in S. 179/H.R. 192. as well as an additional letter to Dr. Lubchenco on October 16, 2012 urging the Administration to support the creation of a marine monument. NOAA/ONMS supports the CBNMS and GFNMS northern expansion legislation introduced by Congresswoman Lynn Woolsey, however, NOAA/ONMS does not support creating sanctuaries through national marine monument. The national marine sanctuary designation process is preferred as it has multiple opportunities for public engagement and stakeholder buy-in during the expansion process and afterwards. Congresswoman Lynn Woolsey has been engaged in discussions with the NOAA Administrator, Dr. Lubchenco, regarding expediting an administrative process to expand the sanctuaries. The SAC may want to have a special Advisory Council meeting with CBNMS Advisory Council in January if NOAA decides to move forward on an expedited administrative action to expand GFNMS and CBNMS north.

### *Boat Grounding/Capsizing*

The Sanctuary responded to one boat grounding and one capsized vessel since the last SAC meeting in August. The Fjord Queen, an albacore fishing vessel, grounded in mid-October near Ross Cove and at the time of the meeting was still grounded and breaking up. Volunteers were removing debris manually and suggestions to hire a possible crane to remove remaining debris were being considered. Secondly, the Sanctuary responded to fragments of the capsized Oracle catamaran that landed on Limantour beach in Point Reyes National Seashore. The 72 foot catamaran capsized on October 16<sup>th</sup> in San Francisco Bay.

### **MBNMS Superintendent's Report**

Karen Grimmer reported on behalf of Paul Michel

At the October 18th SAC meeting in Cambria, approximately 60 members of the public provided comments on the PG&E seismic surveys for the Diablo Canyon nuclear power plant, all voicing opposition to the surveys. The Council advised the Superintendent to send a letter to the Coastal Commission conveying the Council's concerns regarding the surveys: 1) the potential harmful effects of high-decibel sound on marine organisms in sanctuary waters and those that would enter sanctuary waters from the active survey area; and, 2) concern about inadequate time to understand baseline conditions prior to the survey for appropriate monitoring. The letter was sent on October 29<sup>th</sup>. {On Nov 14th, the Coastal Commission voted to deny the permit, so the survey will not be conducted}

MBNMS staff has been meeting with desalination project proponents, consultants, and regulatory agencies to track the process towards implementation of a desalination plant to supply drinking water to the Monterey Peninsula. MBNMS regulations related to desalination include discharge and seabed disturbance. Guidelines that can help agencies develop plans that consider impacts to the environment can be found at:

<http://montereybay.noaa.gov/resourcepro/resmanissues/pdf/050610desal.pdf>



Staff is working on a project to identify "Sanctuary Ecologically Significant Areas" (SEAs) that will assist with sanctuary management for resource protection and research purposes. We are using the best available scientific information, including GIS data layers to locate remarkable, representative, and sensitive habitats that will aid directed guidance for future research and monitoring, education, and management efforts related to emerging human activities such as energy development or climate change. SEAs are not currently part of the MBNMS regulatory regime, yet will be used and applied as a marine spatial management tool. There are three areas potentially identified in the northern management area, and MB and GF staff will be coordinating on these sites.

The Sanctuary Exploration Center has surpassed 31,000 visitors since its July 23rd grand opening. The Center is open Wednesdays through Sundays from 10am to 5pm. For more information visit: <http://montereybay.noaa.gov/vc/sec/welcome.html>

### **CBNMS Superintendent's Report**

Kaitlin Graiff reported on behalf of Dan Howard.

Dan has been participating on the NOAA Habitat Blueprint Southwest (California) planning team. The team, comprised of 15 personnel from NOAA offices, developed criteria to identify a focus area in California as a pilot area for the 3-5 year habitat blueprint project. Seventeen candidate areas were nominated and the blue print team held a workshop at PRBO (11/7 and 11/8) to select the focus area(s) for the southwest region. Stakeholders were notified of the candidate areas and provided comments that will be addressed at the workshop. Visit the following links to read a project fact sheet

<http://www.habitat.noaa.gov/pdf/habitatblueprint6pfactsheet.pdf>  
and project website: <http://www.habitat.noaa.gov/blueprint/index.html>

A collaborative fisheries research project lead by researchers from NMFS, MLML, CDF&G, and Dan representing CBNMS, in collaboration with local captains and anglers are replicating hook and line surveys originally conducted by CDF&G that used charter fishing boats to sample rockfish in the 1980s. The goal is to look at effects to the fish populations since the 2002 closure over Cordell Bank. They are also fishing in areas around the Gulf of the Farallones and Half Moon Bay (Deep Reef) where charter fishing still takes place. The project completed year one of sampling with three trips to each of the three sites. The trips have about 6 anglers and 7 scientists using local boats from Roger Thomas (Salty Lady), Rick Powers (New Sea Angler), and Tom Mattusch (Hula Cat). All of the rockfish are descended with a "sea-qualizer" except for yellowtail that do not show any signs of barotrauma. Three more trips are planned for each of the three sites, likely starting in February, 2013.

Visit the permanent Cordell Bank exhibit at the Oakland Museum on November 11<sup>th</sup> (family day – pay admission), and December 2<sup>nd</sup> (free first Sunday program). The Natural Sciences gallery is closed to the public until June, 2013 so these dates are special Sneak Peek events.



CBNMS SAC will meet on 11/15 with attendance from Bill Douros, a presentation from Tessa Hill about Ocean Acidification, and a vote on a Site Evaluation List (SEL) support letter.

## **BREAK**

### **Advisory Council Business**

Changes were made to August key meeting outcomes with regard to the Tim, Kellyx, Clare, Peter, and Dominique member reports. The updated key meeting outcomes are available on the SAC website here:

[http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12\\_08/key\\_meeting\\_outcomes\\_082312.pdf](http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12_08/key_meeting_outcomes_082312.pdf)

### **Motion to approve the updated August Key Meeting Outcomes**

Motion: Bob Wilson

Second: Kellyx

Vote: all in favor, none opposed, no discussion

### *SAC West Coast Regions Quarterly Report*

The quarterly report can be found at: [http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/about/pdfs/wcr\\_q3\\_2012.pdf](http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/about/pdfs/wcr_q3_2012.pdf)

## **Member Reports**

Dominique restated a request to have all member reports emailed prior to each SAC meeting so they can be incorporated into the meeting notes.

### *Jamie Jahncke-*

In the upcoming months reports will be released to the public regarding the mouse eradication project on Farallon Island. One report will include an impact report on removal of Western Gulls. A finding from the report states that non target mortality of up to 1700 would have no impact to the gull population.

There will be a forage fish workshop in September, 2013. The purpose of the workshop is to synthesize what is known about forage fish, to improve research knowledge for providing information to future management plans, and to assess areas where additional information is needed. A report resulting from the workshop will be useful to managers and policy makers. A request for submissions for presentations will occur in late winter or early spring, 2013.

### *Peter Grenell-*

Peter offered to take SAC members on a walk down the beach to the site of a USACE project, and to the site of a reef project where Cal Academy is partnering. He also offered to show SAC members the sites of these projects when we meet at the HMB Yacht Club for a 2013 SAC meeting.

### *Richard Charter-*

Addressed the ongoing discussion of adaptive coastal management for Sea Level Rise (SLR) in



the area and that, after witnessing Hurricane Sandy first hand, believes that now is truly the time for society to take SLR seriously and to learn from the damage and destruction caused by the recent superstorm.

*John Largier-*

Announced that there is a list of grad students doing important work in the sanctuary and that there should be a mechanism for getting these names and their subsequent work out to the public in order to demonstrate how well the area is being researched by academics.

There will be a number of workshops involving researchers in the area that are addressing the topic of Climate Change indicators. Additionally two important meetings are coming up; 1) CalCOFI symposium December 4<sup>th</sup> and 2) from February 27th to March 1st 2013 will be the State of the California Central Coast Marine Protected Areas held in Monterey.

Several researchers and community members participated in the successful State of the Bay Conference recently presented by the Tomales Bay Watershed Council.

John will be chairing the Pescadero Marsh science panel and will be reporting to SAC on findings and updates resulting from the panel.

The Exploratorium is moving to Pier 15 and John will attend meetings to see about incorporating sanctuary exhibits in the new location.

*Dominique Richard-*

Attended the State of the Bay conference and opened up to the community about the Vessel Management Plan for Tomales Bay, encouraging their thoughts and questions.

Dominique also announced the response from Dan Basta regarding the SAC letter requesting a reopening of the site evaluation list.

*Barbara Emley-*

Nov 15<sup>th</sup> should be the opening for crab season. This will be the last year with unlimited number of traps in the ocean, next year they will be limited. This year's crab size looks good although crab numbers are slightly down.

*Clare O'Reilly-*

Ocean Protection Council September 13th Meeting Highlights: The Council took actions related to improving our understanding of ocean acidification and tentatively approved an MOU among the West Coast Governors Alliance on Ocean Health and the West Coast Ocean Observing Systems. The Council was presented with information on the recently released National Research Council's Sea-level Rise for the Coasts of California, Oregon, and Washington: Past, Present and Future, the success of the Marine Life Protection Act, and California's planned response to the potential impact from Japanese tsunami marine debris.



At the upcoming OPC meeting on November 29<sup>th</sup>, the following items will be on the agenda: 1) A presentation on Superstorm Sandy and extreme events related to climate change; 2) Consideration for funding a competitive grant round to support vulnerability assessments and updates to Local Coastal Programs; 3) An update on OPC's support for state agencies' use and sharing of scientific and geospatial information for coastal- and ocean-relevant decision making; 4) The Council will also receive updates on the following activities that may be of interest to the SAC: climate change, Dungeness crab fishery, California Sustainable Seafood Initiative, West Coast Governors Alliance on Ocean Health, and Marine Debris and Japanese Tsunami Debris.

*Anne Morkill-*

The draft EIS for the Farallon National Wildlife Refuge house mouse eradication project is still underway, with hopeful release of the draft to the public in early 2013 for review and comment. In the absence of significant controversy or litigation, implementation is expected in November/December, 2013.

In support of the mouse eradication project, a gull hazing trial will be conducted on the Farallones from Nov 26th to Dec 17th to test efficacy of hazing gulls during mouse eradication implementation in order to minimize the likelihood of gulls ingesting rodenticide baits. Trial to be led by Island Conservation with assistance from FWS, PRBO, USDA-Wildlife Services, and Oiled Wildlife Care Network. A marine mammal Incidental Harassment Authorization (IHA) will be obtained and a Sanctuary overflight permit has been applied for as helicopters and possibly Unmanned Aerial Systems (UAS) will be used to help monitor and possibly haze gulls.

The Farallon septic system was pumped out during the week of Nov 12-16, 2012. Solid waste was pumped into twelve 300-gallon totes and flown to and from the island to the mainland for disposal. Other maintenance work during the same period included additional repairs to the landing derrick and zip-line supports.

A Refuge Law Enforcement Officer has been working with Cal Fish and Game and US Coast Guard to develop a partnership between applicable agencies for enforcing the fishing and maritime regulations of the National Marine Sanctuaries and the State of California, in conjunction with the enforcement of the Endangered Species Act, Marine Mammal Protection Act, Migratory Bird Treaty Act, and the Refuge Recreation Act in order to protect the natural resources along the coast of the San Francisco Bay and Monterey Bay Areas.

Anne will be attending the Marine Protected Areas Federal Advisory Committee meeting in Santa Cruz on Dec 4-6, 2012, and participating in a panel discussion on how local marine protected areas can engage with the travel, recreation and tourism industries.

*Tim Duff-*

There is an anticipated February ribbon cutting ceremony for the completed tunnel at Devil's Slide. Tim suggested that settlement funds from the Mavericks movie go towards impacts caused in the area as well as toward the cost of life rescue training opportunities.



*Bob Breen-*

California Academy of Sciences assisted in a science survey Monday, Tuesday, and Wednesday November 12th -14th to engage citizens in research at the reef. Contact Rebecca Johnson at Cal Academy for more information regarding the surveys.

*Jackie Dragon-*

Jackie was a guest on Jennifer Stock's (CBNMS Ed/Outreach Coord) monthly KWMR radio program Ocean Currents. The program covered the recent developments, stemming from the JWG on Ship Strikes and Acoustics, on making sanctuary waters safer for whales by preventing ship strikes. Jackie was joined in the studio by fellow JWG members Michael Carver of CBNMS, John Berge of PMSA, and on the phone by John Calambokidis of Cascadia Research and Mike Van Houten/USCG. Guests were able to get lots of great information on the progress being made on the issue such as the app under development to coordinate whale sighting data, and the excellent multi-stakeholder collaboration with industry, conservation, science, and agencies that went into the JWG process, and is moving forward. The podcast of the show is posted on the Cordell Bank NMS website here:

<http://cordellbank.noaa.gov/education/radiopodcast2012.html>

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Name: Sabrina Brennan

Affiliation: Elected to San Mateo county harbor district, to be sworn in January, 2013.

Sabrina wanted to introduce herself to the SAC and express her appreciation for all the hard work we do individually and as an advisory group.

**Salmonid Restoration at San Mateo Resource Conservation District** (Kellyx Nelson)

Presentation available on SAC website at:

[http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12\\_11/sanmateo\\_rcd\\_ppt.pdf](http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12_11/sanmateo_rcd_ppt.pdf)

**LUNCH**

**Ocean Climate Indicators Update** (Maria Brown for Benet Duncan)

Presentation available on SAC website at:

[http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12\\_11/duncan\\_climateppt.pdf](http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12_11/duncan_climateppt.pdf)

**Discussion** raised a question about why pH was considered a biological rather than physical indicator.

**Climate Change Indicators Working Group Request** (Action Item)

A request was made to form a climate change indicators working group from November, 2012 through September, 2013. The working group will include three meetings with the following goals: 1) define climate change indicator monitoring goals, and strategies to meet those goals; 2) determine implementation timelines, partners, and funding needs; and, 3) develop an Ocean Climate Indicators Monitoring Plan.



**Discussion** raised questions regarding why so few working group meetings were to be scheduled. SAC members inquired about what type of person (preferred profile, background, expertise) would be ideal to become a member of the working group. It was suggested that research scientists AND managers be involved in the working group to make sure that the plan is applicable and effectively implemented. Questions were also raised regarding the geographical reach of the project and whether that would require participation by a member of Cordell Bank staff or CBNMS SAC to also participate in the working group.

**Motion to create a Climate Change Indicators Working Group:**

Motion: Richard Charter

Second: John Largier

Vote: all in favor, no discussion

John Largier and Jaime expressed interest in being either chair or co-chair. Dominique expressed interest in joining the working group pending his availability. The working group chair and co-chair (to be determined) along with Benet, will decide who the working group members will be, followed by Maria's approval based on balance and expertise of representatives. The working group will also need to decide if it would like to hold their meetings open to the public.

**Deep Sea Coral Cruise** (Jan Roletto)

Presentation available on SAC website at:

[http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12\\_11/dsc\\_ppt.pdf](http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12_11/dsc_ppt.pdf)

**BREAK**

**Whales and Shipping Presentation** (Andrea Dransfield)

Presentation will be available at a later date

**Seabirds and Human Uses Presentation** (Jennifer McGowan)

Presentation will be available at a later date

**Discussion** suggested changing the human impact slide, to better explain that all the human activities are cumulative and not ranked in order of worst to least impacting. Based on interest in this topic, below is a link to the California Ocean Uses Atlas where you can view the individual layers of impact related to various human uses from the National MPA Center Website: [http://www.mpa.gov/dataanalysis/atlas\\_ca/](http://www.mpa.gov/dataanalysis/atlas_ca/). There is also a viewer where you can view each of the layers individually: [http://www.mpa.gov/dataanalysis/atlas\\_ca/](http://www.mpa.gov/dataanalysis/atlas_ca/).

**Advisory Council Business Continued**

*FY13 Work Plan*

The SAC continued review of FY13 Work Plan. Additions and/or edits were made to the following sections: 1) water quality; 2) emergency response; 3) wildlife disturbance; 4)



ecosystem protection/fishing activities; and, 5) northern management area. Edits were added to the updated work plan and are posted on the SAC website here:

[http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/workplan2013/gf\\_workplan\\_fy13.pdf](http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/workplan2013/gf_workplan_fy13.pdf)

Pertaining to the aquaculture section of the Work Plan, there will be a Federal Register notice on aquaculture in the Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary, accompanied by a public comment period. GFNMS staff will inform the SAC when this is released. Additionally a new SAC training will be offered to educate SAC members on official government guidelines for internal processes with regard to members of the public and members of the SAC.

*FY13 Meeting Schedule*

Pending a decision to move forward with the northern boundary expansion, there is a tentative joint meeting with Cordell Bank on January 24<sup>th</sup>. Meeting may be only a half day, roughly 3 hour, issue specific meeting for briefing on the expansion process.

A suggestion was made to move the joint MB GF SAC meeting to either Wednesday February 20<sup>th</sup>, or Thursday February 21<sup>st</sup>.

The remainder of SAC meetings will be moving to the third Wednesday rather than Thursday of the month in which meetings are held. Finalized meeting dates for the remainder of 2013 include: Wednesday May 15<sup>th</sup>, Wednesday August 21<sup>st</sup>, and Wednesday November 20<sup>th</sup>. Locations for all meetings will stay the same, with venues TBD.

*FY13 Retreat*

Council members suggested having the retreat at the site of the new Exploratorium once it opens in spring, 2013. Date TBD.

**ADJOURN** - 3:30pm

Attendance

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SEAT</b>	<b>P/A</b>
Dominique Richard [Council Chair]	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma	P
Richard Kuehn	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma-Alt	A
Kellyx Nelson	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo	P
Tim Duff	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo Alternate	P
Catherine Kuhlman	CA Ocean Protection Council	A
Clare O'Reilly	CA OPC Alternate	P
Richard Charter [Council Vice-Chair]	Conservation	P
Bruce Bowser	Conservation Alternate	P
Bob Wilson	Conservation	P



Jackie Dragon	Conservation Alternate	A
Bob Breen	Education	P
Vacant	Education Alternate	
Barbara Emley [Council Secretary]	Maritime Activities/ Commercial	P
Peter Grenell	Maritime Activities/Commercial Alternate	P
Mick Menigoz	Maritime Activities/Recreational	P
George Clyde	Maritime Activities/Recreational Alternate	P
John Largier	Research	P
Jaime Jahncke	Research Alternate	P
Cicely Muldoon	National Park Service	A
Frank Dean	National Park Service Alternate	A
Anne Morkill	USFWS	P
Gerry McChesney	USFWS Alternate	A
LT Bradley Soule	USCG	A
LTJG Noelle Kitenko	USCG Alternate	A
Pat Rutten	NMFS [non-voting]	A
Natalie-Constantino Manning	NMFS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Maria Brown	GFNMS [non-voting]	P
Chris Mobley	CINMS [non-voting]	A
Mike Murray	CINMS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Dan Howard	CBNMS [non-voting]	A
Kaitlin Graiff	CBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	P
Paul Michel	MBNMS [non-voting]	A
Karen Grimmer	MBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	P