



**GULF OF THE FARALLONES NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY (GFNMS)
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING/AFTERNOON JOINT MEETING WITH CORDELL
BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY**

Bodega Bay Grange Hall
Bodega Bay, CA
9:15AM – 4:15 PM
Thursday January 24, 2013

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, REVIEW AGENDA

Copies to:

Bill Douros, ONMS West Coast Regional Office

Dominique Richard called the meeting to order at 9:29 AM

Review Agenda

Agenda approved at: 9:32AM

Superintendent's Report:

Permits:

Reviewed: 1) Managers permit to Gerry McChesney and USFWS for hazing trials of Western Gulls using aerial crafts to help develop the mouse eradication program on the Farallon Islands from Fall 2012 - Spring 2013. 2) Salvage permit to Barry Day to use two motorized personal watercrafts for removing pieces of the *Fjord Queen*. The permit was issued January 5th. 3) Permit to Jeff Clark for the Mavericks Invitational for use of 15 motorized personal watercrafts for search and rescue, filming, and transport, as well as to temporarily install a buoy for marking a gathering area for surfers. The permit was issued November 9th.

Under review: 1) Research permit for Sean Van Sommeran for tagging, documentation, and biopsy sampling of white and basking sharks in the Monterey Bay sanctuary. Additional information requested. 2) Education permit for James Mosquito of Great White Adventures for attracting white sharks as part of his educational tourism operation. Application received and under review. 3) Research permit for John Takekawa to install stainless steel rods and PVC piping in Bolinas Lagoon as well as core sediment samples to gather data on sediment rates, hydrology, vegetation, and tidal range of vulnerable nearshore habitat. Permit is under review and additional information is requested.



3rd Biennial Climate Change Summit: The summit will be held February 20, 2013, 9:45AM – 3:30PM at the Golden Gate Club in the Presidio in San Francisco. The day includes the release of the Our Coast Our Future tool, ocean acidification messages and outreach strategies, and climate adaptation planning initiatives happening in the San Francisco Bay Area.

Mavericks: The contest occurred last Sunday and was effective at keeping crowds off beaches and cliffs. Only one incident of a cited MPWC was reported. Awaiting wildlife observers report regarding any disturbances.

SF International Ocean Film Festival: The 10th annual SFIOFF is March 7-10 with Jean Michel Cousteau as the special guest. Cordell Bank is sponsoring the student film competition and has a film in the festival as well.

Tomales Bay Vessel Management Plan: About 80% of the public comments received in the fall were recently addressed at a meeting with the State Lands Commission (SLC). Comments not addressed are outside of sanctuary jurisdiction. Finalization of the plan should occur at the April SLC meeting. In the meantime stakeholder and interagency meetings will be held to address some of the comments received.

Enforcement: We have been working in close coordination with the U.S. Coast Guard on training regulations and sanctuary enforcement priorities. Thanks to Lt Brad Soule, sanctuary training materials are being incorporated into standard USCG training. New officer Jason Lee, at the Santa Rosa office, will set aside a portion of his time for sanctuary enforcement issues.

Essential Fish Habitat: At the last SAC meeting the Deep Sea Coral Cruise information and video were presented (available here: http://farallones.noaa.gov/science/dsc_cruise.html). Gulf of the Farallones and Cordell Bank staff are annotating the video and inputting into NMFS data to develop a report, to be presented at the April PFMC meeting, where the council will determine whether to continue forward with accepting new EFH proposals.

Boat groundings: There were seven boat groundings in calendar year 2012. Two groundings resulted in oil spills and two in marine debris, with four uninsured vessels requiring the use of all available sanctuary funding. We are currently unable to respond to the most recent grounding, the *Fjord Queen*, which all told will take months for vessel removal. No additional resources other than staff time are available.

Discussion initiated by Barbara Emley questioned the type of insurance required for salvage coverage. The sanctuary will investigate the insurance question in 2013. Additional discussion by Pat Rutten brought up the Coast Guard's use of the fund center for removal of vessels. He also brought up the need to begin a larger discussion with the proper authorities, including the Coast Guard, regarding salvage laws specifically in the sanctuary, as well as potential cost of damage, and post-grounding restoration costs. Currently discussions have occurred with the Captain of the Port. Catherine Kuhlman expressed the State's interest in the conversation and Dan Howard voiced Park Service interest as well.

CBNMS Superintendent's Report

Cordell Bank has a three-year agreement with the SF International Ocean Film Festival, which includes sponsoring the student film competition.

Cordell Bank is involved in the California Collaborative Fisheries Research project, working with Cal Fish and Wildlife and Cal Sea Grant, volunteer captains, and recreational fishermen to sample areas previously surveyed by Fish and Game in the 80s and 90s, evaluating effects of recreational groundfish areas that have been closed for over a decade. Surveys will be in Half Moon Bay, the Farallones, and Bodega Bay out to Cordell Bank. The next cruise is in February; species composition size, fecundity and reproductive success will be analyzed. The next summer and fall will be the second year of studies. Sea Grant and the Fisheries Service will perform data analysis.

Cordell Bank is backfilling the research coordinator position, to be a permanent FTE. The job request will be out in a few months. Candidates with a PhD and 3-5 years experience are ideal.

Lilli Ferguson is transferring from Florida Keys NMS to Cordell Bank on February 4th to work exclusively on the proposed boundary expansion. Lilli will likely help with the environmental analysis and begin to look at eventual management plan revision as the boundary expansion process moves forward. Lilli will be working closely with GFNMS as well.

Jenny hosted three climate change workshops in the summer and fall, in partnership with GFNMS, FMSA, Romberg Tiburon Center, and SF Bay National Estuarine Research Reserve. The workshops were well received, in particular one with a field component at Hog Island Oyster Co. that discussed impacts of Ocean Acidification on the shellfish growing industry. Jenny is looking to continue teacher trainings through a webinar series, and is also involved with Oikonos to develop education material for a series of five Winged Ambassadors classes that discuss ocean issues, including marine debris.

There will be a soft opening of the Cordell Bank exhibit at the Oakland Museum with a grand opening sometime in June. Jenny is working with docents to develop content using the Cordell Bank exhibit for 3-5th grade elementary school groups.

In November the International Maritime Organization released their decision to approve the new shipping lanes. The Coast Guard is moving into the federal rulemaking process and hoping for a June date to finalize the process. Although the new lanes cannot be on charts until then, work is being done to reach out to vessels and the shipping industry to inform them of the new lanes.

Michael and staff at GFNMS and CINMS are working on a whale spotter app to gather real-time information on where whales are and when. Leslie will be working with Michael on this, and looking into holding workshops on the development process. Stellwagon Bank is working with Coast Guard auxiliary on whale watching boats to collect data on whale distribution so that may



be one approach to explore data retrieval for the sanctuaries.

MBNMS Superintendent's Report

In December Monterey Bay NMS presented to their SAC about a project to identify and establish ecologically significant areas. The SAC was interested in the new online GIS ArcView tool currently in development for public use. The staff also provided an update to the Research Activity Panel and the Conservation Working Group, asking members for additional information on locations potentially useful to the research community.

At the same meeting, MB SAC members passed two actions related to forage species; the first a letter to the Pacific Fisheries Management Council and Cal Fish and Wildlife Commission expressing support for recently adopted policies on forage species. A second resolution requested MBNMS to identify opportunities to advance policies, science, and work with fisheries management bodies. At the same meeting a motion was passed to form a subcommittee to study the Motorized Personal Watercraft rules as it applies to surfer safety. The committee, with support from staff, will meet at the end of January to discuss the issue and report back to the MB SAC in February.

GF Advisory Council Business

Please remember to review the draft notes prior to the SAC meetings.

Two changes were made to the November, 2012 draft notes:

- 1) George Clyde requested clarification on the wording that describes SAC member roles on engaging with experts regarding various sanctuary related topics.
- 2) Wording on Jaime's member report was corrected regarding the house mouse hazing trials.

Motion to approve November 2012 Meeting Notes

Motion: Richard Charter

Second: Barbara Emley

Vote: All approved, none opposed, no abstentions

The November 2012 Key Meeting Outcomes can be found at:

http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12_11/nov2012notes_final.pdf

2013 Meeting Schedule

The next SAC meeting will be held on Wednesday, May 22nd in San Francisco, location TBD. The SAC retreat will be at the new Exploratorium; we are proposing Wednesday, October 16.

BREAK:



San Francisco Pacifica Exclusion Area Boundary Update

Max Delaney gave the UCSB Bren School of the Environment student's presentation

Presentation link: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13_01/bren_01242013sac_md.pdf

Discussion

Suggestions for several edits/areas of clarification on the presentation including changes to slides discussing natural resources and potential future uses.

NOAA Habitat Blueprint

Link to presentation: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13_01/acmtg_blueprints.pdf

Presentation Discussion:

Dan: We are in the process of selecting the implementation team but the hope is to elevate the importance of NOAA habitat restoration work in the area and, with that, gain more financial support for habitat restoration around the country. The story in this region is high profile (endangered species, a previous blue ribbon salmonid stream, and the cache of the wine country), which further defined the importance of that habitat restoration work. Also the requirement to deliver something in 3-5 years helped us choose this area because so much work is already being done. NOAA will be implementing this same process in most of the regions around the country over the next year. When we get to the implementation process NOAA is looking to detail someone out to the region.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Kathleen Cannon: I'm a former Beach Watch volunteer at beach 108 for six and a half years beginning in 1998, now I am a Beach Watch ambassador. As a Sonoma county resident in Petaluma, I have been interested in expanding the boundary northward for years. I love the ocean and the beaches and am very excited about the possibility of GF and CB expanding, and I plan on volunteering to be a Beach Watch volunteer for Sonoma county beaches.

LUNCH

GF/CB Advisory Council Business

George Clyde is sitting in for Lance as Cordell Bank Sanctuary Advisory Council Chair.

Bill Douros joins the meeting.

WCR Quarterly Report:

Link to report: http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/about/pdfs/wcr_q4_2012.pdf

Kate will send out the West Coast Region's quarterly report prior to each SAC meeting. At the meetings she will give an even shorter update of the report to help save time for other Advisory Council business. Members agreed on a shorter update during this segment of each meeting.

SAC Summit:

Dominique: The SAC chairs summit occurred in December. The big message from Dan Basta was that the sanctuaries are not visible within NOAA and in general. The Great Outdoors Plan with the Obama administration makes no mention of ocean yet there are economic contributions from sanctuaries that bring money to the economy, so sanctuaries need to increase visibility. Two objectives for achieving this: 1) Evaluate how we can attract visitors so they know this expansive water by name (i.e. Yosemite); and, 2) Educate visitors about the balance of management needed, and how they are directly connected to these bodies of water.

Discussions talked about how to connect to various groups, suggesting Visitors Bureaus and Chamber of Commerce, as well as branding and social media, and SAC roles in this engagement. With tourist attractions in San Francisco and nearby National Parks, we need to figure out how to bring people to the Sanctuaries in our area. Dominique suggests a SAC brainstorm session for raising these questions, including possible need for a working group, or tourism seat. Follow up on this item will be on a future SAC meeting agenda.

GF/ CB Member Reports

Sarah Hameed: In spreading the news about the impending expansion she's received positive feedback from the surfing and research communities. Fishermen want to know what it means for their fishing spots and recently implemented MPAs.

John Berge: He reached out to the Coast Guard about shipping lane changes, and the implementation date for the proposed lane changes is scheduled for June 1st, 2013.

Jaime Jahncke: At the last meeting GFNMS Advisory Council approved establishment of a Climate Indicators Working Group. Jaime is Chair and Benet and Kelley are supporting staff. The group will have 10-15 members and meet three times between March and September, 2013. The goal of the working group is to define monitoring goals and strategies for the ocean climate indicators, and determine timeline, partners, and funding needs for an eventual monitoring and inventory plan for ocean climate indicators in the north central California coast region.

ACCESS cruise dates are in May, July, and September. Two graduate students will be joining us, as well as a Teacher-at-Sea joining the July survey. Catherine Davis will be working with us to develop ocean acidification protocol for the ACCESS cruises and working with us for the next three summers. She will help establish data on *Foraminifera* and shell thickness.

Bruce Bowser: Bruce published his 3rd edition of *Coastal Currents* in the three times a week Bolinas newspaper. As a part of the GFNMS Marine Debris program his team has not found

much debris at their South Beach site, but he did find a piece of the Oracle fin. Asked to go out during the king tides activity this last month, Bruce noticed that water does lap at the asphalt surface of Bolinas Lagoon, so the riprap Caltrans insisted on looks like it will save a lot of money on roadways. Also because of the king tides, there was an extremely low tide at Duxbury, which was a good opportunity to practice rocky shore naturalist training at Duxbury Reef. There was an excellent article in the January 11th digital *Newsweek* on deep sea exploration.

Jackie Dragon: The California Fish and Wildlife Commission will meet on February 6th and 7th to review a petition for the inclusion of the north eastern population of white sharks to be considered a candidate species under the California Endangered Species Act for full review and protection. Green Peace and other organizations have written letters supporting that effort. Scientists say that population has 100 breeding females, and there are issues with bycatch of juveniles in gill net fisheries in southern California and Mexico.

Richard Charter: As Congresswoman Woolsey prepared to retire, Nancy Pelosi asked what she wanted her legacy to be. Woolsey showed her the bill containing the boundary expansion proposal up to Point Arena, so Pelosi took it on with Dr. Lubchenco, and it all came down to the Whitehouse Christmas tree. It won't always be easy, fun, or fast, but it will be historical. So to the many people who care about this coast and donate so many hours of your time, thank you.

Dominique Richard: There is a Department of Interior suit and a mandatory injunction regarding the oyster farm in Drake's Estero with a final ruling set for tomorrow. A plan is going to be drafted for oil spill preparedness in west Marin. Last Saturday there was a memorial for Rich Stallcup who passed a few weeks ago. It is a tremendous loss for the Beach Watch program and generally speaking a loss for the good people he always asked us to be.

Barbara Emley: The crab season is winding down, but prices stayed around \$3 all season so the fishermen had a good year. The herring season has started and seems to be going well. All in all, on behalf of the San Francisco Community Fishing Association the industry is doing pretty well.

Claire O'Reilly: At the last Ocean Protection Council meeting on November 29th the council agreed to fund \$2.5 million in competitive grants to be administered through the California Coastal Conservancy and Coastal Commission. Next OPC meeting will be March 27th. The Central Coast MPA Symposium is from February 27th to March 1st in Monterey and will discuss how local MPAs are doing.

Bob Wilson: I want to introduce Chris Kelly the new executive director of the Farallones Marine Sanctuary Association. Chris looks forward to working with Maria and her teams to grow FMSA and GFNMS programs, work on fundraising, and build the FMSA board. If you know people who are interested in joining please get in touch with Chris. Bob also wants to remind everyone that the Association has a Krill Club where your participation helps fund FMSA projects.

George Clyde: Recommends a regular item on the agenda for a FMSA report. Additionally, there is a tavern near Hog Island that a group of people want to restore. A developer, who issued a



report on the building, said that sea level rise (SLR) was a concern for the year 2050, but the Coastal Commission came back and stated that due to SLR, the structure could be in danger within 18 years. This is a real life example of impacts due to climate change and sea level rise. George invites participants, particularly sanctuary staff, to join him on Tomales Bay during the winter Audubon Canyon Ranch bird counts from 9AM to 2PM.

Bob Breen: California Fish and Wildlife is setting up a county wide advisory council to advise on the management of the three state MPA's located within the county. This pilot program is sponsored by the Marine Life Protection Act Initiative. Advisory recommendations that come out of the program will be considered throughout San Mateo county.

Kevin Krick: There will be a North American Marine Environmental Protection Association meeting on February 28th on the Queen Mary in Long Beach that will discuss harmonizing California's environmental regulations. The keynote speaker is Coast Guard Rear Admiral Shultz. We will discuss mission control areas, invasive species, and marine spatial planning,

Bill Douros: National Sanctuary leadership has focused on 3 major goals for the program this year: 1) An increase in resources including the budget. The federal budget is on continuing resolution until March 27th. National Marine Sanctuaries are unique among federal programs in that we have a mandate to raise funds. The West Coast has done very well in terms of construction such as the Santa Cruz Exploration Center as well as the Cordell Bank exhibit in the Oakland Museum. We are pooling funding for a boating information center in Ventura, and the Channel Islands campus will open in UCSB at the end of May, as well as hopeful office expansion for Cordell Bank. We are also working on a west coast wide interpretive plan to motivate people to visit Sanctuary stops along the coast. 2) Enhancing protection is another goal. This includes shipping lane changes, vessel safety, and protection of marine mammals. We are also refining wildlife regulations, as it relates to the Joint Management Plan, to clarify standardized wording on introduced species. There is also a request from the Florida Keys Sanctuary Advisory Council to redo zoning on protections. 3) The third major effort is expanding the system. The Farallones and Cordell expansion is a great thing, and NOAA has supported it for a long time. Thunder Bay is going through an expansion process about six months out in front of this process. We just finished expanding the National Marine Sanctuary of American Samoa, from the smallest sanctuary to the largest at 13,000 sq. mi. We are hopeful to reopen the Site Evaluation List as part of the National Ocean Strategy of the Obama administration; both SACs wrote letters in support of this topic. Because of your leadership, these support letters, and urging expansion, people back east are certainly hearing about it.

BREAK

Northern Expansion Briefing and Discussion

Link to presentation:

http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/expansion/Scoping_Northern_FINAL.pdf



Suggestions from SAC members for editing/improving the presentation and preparing for likely questions from the public:

Q: If environmental benefits warrant an expansion, how does that fit into a non-existent budget?

Maria: If the sanctuary is expanded then the protections will automatically be established in the new area (e.g. oil and gas exploration, invasive species, sewage discharge, and seabed disturbance), and then we will hope to expand our programs as resources become available.

Dan: We also have extensive partnerships and volunteers we hope to extend without the need for additional financial support. Current enforcement is almost entirely through partnership with the Coast Guard etc. so we would work to extend those partnerships and create new partnerships.

Bob Wilson: Would it be appropriate for associations, foundations, and advisory council members to go to their congressmen to talk about funding availability? Secondly, what is your standing on funding for drafting the EIS and working on the public comments etc.?

Maria: We have a new staff person Lilli Ferguson, individual staff will be working on portions of the Draft Environmental Impact Statement, and we are also hoping to get external consultant support.

Q: Because this is shared waters with the state is this process subject to CEQA?

Maria: No it is not, but federal consistency with the California Coastal Commission is required and it will go to the governor for signature.

Barbara Emley: It seems to me you can't have a windfarm without seabed disturbance so how could something like that be established in the sanctuary?

Maria: If the public process determines that we need to explore alternative energy and a zone should be created in the new sanctuary to allow for potential alternative energy then that would be included in the DEIS as an exception to the regulations.

Barbara: This expansion was sold to my constituency with the idea that commercial fishing would be secured but knowing there is wiggle room on exceptions for regulations then I don't know how they can feel confident in supporting this.

Bill Douros: There are commitments made by Woolsey's office and the state of California that all concerns, fears, problems need to be heard and addressed in some form.

Q: Who makes the final determination on added regulations or exceptions that would be made?

Maria: The Office of National Marine Sanctuaries through NOAA makes the final decision.

Planning for Proposed Expansion Workshop by Seaweb

Link to presentation: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13_01/finalsac_seawebppt.pdf

Daria Siciliano and Rich Wilson described the goals of the upcoming February 21st planning workshop to identify, discuss, and prioritize key marine planning issues related to CBNMS and GFNMS boundary expansion. A worksheet was handed out with four questions for council member feedback to help develop the workshop agenda.



Discussion question 1: What are the top three issues that should be considered under the sanctuary expansion proposal? (E.g. water quality)

- Water quality as it relates to Russian River outflow.
- Coastal streams that support salmonids (Steelhead and Coho) in the expansion area.
- Renewable energy; consider protecting existing habitats before installing infrastructure.
- Habitat quality and habitat protection.
- Focus on the ecosystem as a whole and expand on science/knowledge of linkages. Stress importance of the biological productivity of the area, e.g. plankton and food chain.
- Make the case that this is a unique ecosystem, but also address the budgetary constraints.
- Wildlife conservation areas and the human uses in the region; also identify areas that are not wildlife hotspots and could be opened to activities.
- What outcomes do we suspect for the area and how to monitor those changes over time.
- Expansion area will include more scientific research so consider current and new demands for permitting research.
- What about a Marine Spatial Planning process for the expansion area?
- Concern about and need more information on how shipping traffic will be addressed in expansion area. Build upon the CB and GF vessel strikes joint working group report.
- Need greater public engagement and support.
- Need for infrastructure – such as boats.
- Recreational fishing concerns about any new regulations, so need to clarify how expansion will affect the regulatory scheme for recreational fishermen.
- Climate change – opportunities for research and mitigation?

Question 2: What new (not currently existing) marine activities should be considered?

- Most agreed they did not add anything
- Renewable energy and aquaculture will come up
- Increased tourism like whale watching
- Impacts of added activities need to be addressed – positive or negative

Question 3: Who else should be invited to the February workshop?

- Alternative energy and aquaculture industry
- West County supervisors for Marin, Sonoma, and Mendocino
- State parks representative

MEETING ADJOURN 4:15pm

Meeting Attendance

NAME	SEAT	P/A
Dominique Richard [Council Chair]	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma	P
Richard Kuehn	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma-Alt	P



Kellyx Nelson	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo	A
Tim Duff	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo Alternate	A
Catherine Kuhlman	CA Ocean Protection Council	P
Clare O'Reilly	CA OPC Alternate	P
Richard Charter [Council Vice-Chair]	Conservation	P
Bruce Bowser	Conservation Alternate	P
Bob Wilson	Conservation	P
Jackie Dragon	Conservation Alternate	P
Bob Breen	Education	P
Vacant	Education Alternate	
Barbara Emley [Council Secretary]	Maritime Activities/ Commercial	P
Peter Grenell	Maritime Activities/Commercial Alternate	A
Mick Menigoz	Maritime Activities/Recreational	P
George Clyde	Maritime Activities/Recreational Alternate	P
John Largier	Research	A
Jaime Jahncke	Research Alternate	P
Cicely Muldoon	National Park Service	A
Frank Dean	National Park Service Alternate	A
Anne Morkill	USFWS	A
Gerry McChesney	USFWS Alternate	A
LT Bradley Soule	USCG	A
LTJG Noelle Kitenko	USCG Alternate	P
Pat Ruten	NMFS [non-voting]	P
Natalie-Constantino Manning	NMFS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Maria Brown	GFNMS [non-voting]	P
Chris Mobley	CINMS [non-voting]	A
Mike Murray	CINMS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Dan Howard	CBNMS [non-voting]	P
Kaitlin Graiff	CBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	P
Paul Michel	MBNMS [non-voting]	A
Karen Grimmer	MBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	A