

**GULF OF THE FARALLONES NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY (GFNMS)
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING/ AFTERNOON JOINT MEETING**

Great Hall, SF Zoo
1 Zoo Road
San Francisco, CA 94132
9:15 a.m. – 2:30pm
Wednesday, February 19, 2014

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, REVIEW AGENDA

Copies to:

Bill Douros, ONMS West Coast Regional Office
Meeting called to order at: 9:26am

Review Agenda

Roll Call

Swear-in New Council Members: Elizabeth Babcock, California Academy of Sciences

Superintendent's Report

Permits

GFNMS issued a research/education permit to Amy Dean, of the Farallones Marine Sanctuary Association for Long-term Monitoring Program and Experiential Training for Students (LiMPETS). This is a student-based citizen science program for students, teachers and community groups which collects long-term sandy beach and rocky intertidal data along the coast of California. The permit authorizes the replacement of five (5) existing epoxy markers at various sites with steel bolts and the placement of six (6) new steel bolts (two at Fitzgerald Marine Reserve, two at Pillar Point, and two at Pigeon Point).

GFNMS issued an education permit to James Moskito of Great White Adventures for attracting white sharks for education purposes as part of ecotourism charters for the public at the Farallon Islands.

Northern Boundary Expansion

The proposed rule/DEIS will go through General Council before it can be submitted for public review. GFNMS will need to make revisions to these documents once they are returned; the draft management plan will then be revised to include the expansion areas. The release of the draft is slated for spring of 2014, with public hearings scheduled in SF, Bodega Bay, Gualala, and Pt. Arena. The duration of the public comment period will be at least 60 days for all three of the documents.

Tomales Bay Vessel Management Plan update

GFNMS is on schedule to implement the Mooring Program this summer. GFNMS is currently working on details with agency partners. GFNMS will present exact launch date at the May meeting.

Mavericks Surf Contest

GFNMS staff attended the annual Mavericks Invitational Surf Contest on January 24th at the Mavericks surf break near Pillar Point, in Half Moon Bay. GFNMS staff attended to observe potential wildlife disturbance. Other federal, state, and local agencies attended in human safety and resource protection roles. GFNMS staff and wildlife observers witnessed one potential wildlife disturbance from a low flying helicopter; the incident is being investigated. NOAA's Office of Law Enforcement was present and issued citations for unauthorized Motorized Personal Water Craft ("JetSki") riders. GFNMS staff also provided an educational booth and interacted with thousands of festival-goers throughout the day.

SAC Terms and Recruitment

There will be several open seats in the SAC this year: Conservation (Primary and Alternate), At-Large Marin/Sonoma (Primary and Alternate), Research (Primary and Alternate), Maritime Recreational (Primary and Alternate) and At-Large San Mateo/San Francisco (alternate only). Half of the non-governmental, voting seats will be up for re-appointment this year and half next year.

Sea Star Wasting

A wasting disease has been spreading, causing mass mortality of sea stars along the west coast since summer 2013. Primarily affecting sunflower and ochre stars, which ecologists consider to be keystone species, the disease is now affecting areas from San Diego to Alaska. The affliction causes white lesions to develop on the sea star's skin and an unnatural twisting of the arms. Scientists don't know how many of the tens of millions of sea stars along the coast have the disease. Pete Raimondi, Ph. D., a professor of ecology and evolutionary biology at the University of California, Santa Cruz, estimates it may be in the tens of thousands to the low millions. A mortality event of this magnitude, with such broad geographic reach, has never before been documented. Scientists anticipate that such a large mortality event in a keystone species could change entire intertidal and sub-tidal seascapes.

Climate Change

Thirty scientists, natural resource managers, and policy experts participated in the first of a 2-workshop series to develop climate change vulnerability assessments for the North-central California Coast and Ocean Climate-Smart Adaptation Project. This is the first phase of a collaborative effort to develop adaptive management actions for Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary and other natural resource agencies to take in response to, and in preparation for, climate change impacts. Workshop participants identified priority species, habitats and ecosystem services (termed focal resources) and discussed their information needs and available sources of data for use in future vulnerability assessments. The second workshop, tentatively planned for May 2014, will assess the vulnerability of the focal resources to climate change impacts through the use of an extensive literature review, expert elicitation and regional

modeling. These assessments will provide a framework for the development of adaptive management strategies through a working group of local scientific experts and natural resource managers, targeted to be convened in late summer 2014. For more information, visit the workshop support webpage at <http://www.ecoadapt.org/workshops/north-central-ca-focal-resources>.

More information on these and other items can be found on the Quarterly Superintendent's Report: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/14_02/1stQuartSupeReportFY2014.pdf

MBNMS Superintendent's Report

The MBNMS office report can be found at:

<http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2014/140221/140214sacoff.pdf>

CBNMS Superintendent's Report

CBNMS has been working side by side with GFNMS on our proposed boundary expansion and evolving our effort to reduce the risk of ships hitting whales.

In November, GFNMS and CBNMS completed the second year of field sampling at Cordell Bank, Farallon Islands and Deep Reef off of Half Moon Bay to evaluate the response of rockfish populations to Rockfish Conservation Area fishery closures. Goal of project is to investigate how fish populations have responded after 10 years of protection by comparing new catch data with historic data collected from 1987 thru 1998 (species composition, size, catch per unit effort). This two year project was funded by Collaborative Fisheries Research West and Rick Starr from California Sea Grant is the project lead; primary partners include [NMFS](#) Santa Cruz, [CDFG](#), the [Fisheries & Conservation Biology Lab](#) at [Moss Landing Marine Laboratory](#), Charter boat captains in Half Moon Bay, Sausalito and Bodega and volunteer fishermen.

Jennifer Stock has put a traveling Cordell Bank photo display together and has been shopping it around to find venues in the bay area. It is currently in the red barn classroom at the Point Reyes National Seashore and has been shown previously at Point Reyes and Stinson Beach libraries. CBNMS has hosted a community event at each of the venues. Being an offshore site, the traveling display helps bring the sanctuary to the people.

Office construction is moving along at Point Reyes and includes an office for GFNMS. Based on the recent cost estimate of the office renovation, CBNMS is revisiting the idea to develop a shared ocean visitor space at the Point Reyes lighthouse. This will be a partnership among Cordell Bank and Gulf of the Farallones sanctuaries, Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation, and the Point Reyes National Seashore. We will be kicking the effort off with a one day meeting with NOAA and Park staff to develop themes for the shared interpretive space. For our meeting, we will be using our west coast interpretive plan, and considering existing Park visitor center themes as well as ideas that are being developed for the Gulf of the Farallones visitor center.

BREAK

Advisory Council Business

Action Item: Approve Meeting Notes for November 2013

Motion: Richard Charter

Second: Barbara Emley

Approve: yes

Abstain: Kellyx, Bob Wilson and Elizabeth Babcock

Oppose: 0

Important: SAC will only count votes on controversial issues; otherwise they will vote with ayes and nays

Retreat

The retreat will be closed to the public, and will be held on Oct 8. The following ideas were proposed as possible foci for the retreat. A discussion and decision of these will be made at a later date.

- 1) A commercial maritime activities theme, focused on shipping and traffic outside the Golden Gate. USCG facility (possible the Vessel Traffic Control) is a possibility, with tour of a ship also possible.
- 2) Retreat focused on learning more about the proposed USFWS mouse eradication project on SEFI.
- 3) Expansion focused retreat in Gualala- see and get familiar with the north coast.
- 4) Business and Programmatic expansion theme: invite Dan Basta, sanctuary staff present business and programmatic plans for how they will manage the northern expansion area.

Youth Seat Update

We hope to welcome our new Youth seats at the May 1st joint meeting.

Member Reports

Pat Rutten

NMFS had a meeting with Sonoma County Water Agency, Bodega Marine Lab, and others to start framing what we want to do with the estuary as a vulnerable habitat under the Our Coast Our Future (OCOF) program. He is talking with Dan tomorrow about the projects Point Blue can fund over the next few years. Ideally, OCOF will extend its resources up the Sonoma Coast to continue sea level rise impact knowledge. There is also some interest in removing the breakwater jetty at the mouth of Russian River; it's a historic site with a lot of nautical history.

Cecily Muldoon

At the end of March, Golden Gate National Recreation Area and Point Reyes National Seashore (PRNS) are holding a Bio Blitz: a 24-hour intensive surveying of every species found in designated areas. Additionally, there are ongoing multiple lawsuits pertaining to Drake's Bay Oyster Company; the oyster company is filing a brief to Supreme Court. Finally, it is elephant seal pupping season at PRNS.

LT Cody Dunagan

Cody received stationing orders and will be moving to NC this summer, so the May meeting will be his last. Joe Giammanco will take over.

Kellyx Nelson

The Pillar Point harbor fecal sources study is done; the report is pending and the Resources Conservation District plans to send out a press release with a summary of the high points. Additionally, the CA Central Coast Conservation Action Tracker is ready; this is a conservation tracker to see what's going on along the coast in terms of conservation projects.

This year saw another epic fish kill of steelhead trout in Pescadero Marsh. The Conservation District removed the lowest-most dam from San Francisquito Creek, improving 40+ miles of spawning area for steelhead. Additionally, the Conservation District is working with the UFW's Coastal Program to define and make available to restoration professionals a database summarizing the barriers to salmon. Finally, the Conservation District just wrote up a small white paper on the barriers we're facing on getting voluntary conservation efforts to help with point-based sources of water pollution.

Peter Grennell

There was a sea level impacts conference at the College of San Mateo a few weeks ago. San Mateo County is responding to growing concern that the county's ocean and bay shorelines and economies will be dramatically affected by from sea level rise losses. There are some joint efforts from various entities to consider response and adaptations; this will likely have implications/concerns for the sanctuary. San Mateo County is in the middle of a project in Princeton to fill up a policy hole, targeting the zoning changes and land use map concerns for future development and property use (shoreline erosion); there are potentially some concerns of impacts to water quality from such development.

Bob Wilson

Last year the spring water conditions in ocean current and temperature shifted from south to north, causing high sea lion pup mortality throughout the state. This year there is interest in seeing if this event will repeat itself. We can see some early changes as elephant seal pups are doing really well; we haven't had big tides or issues but we're very cautious about what weather conditions will mean for southern California animals.

Richard Charter

CA Coastal Commission held a meeting to discuss offshore fracking off of Pismo Beach; this activity continues after many years with no alerts to agencies. This area is adjacent to CINMS. The Coastal Commission is hoping to get notification of future events. This is important because

it's occurring under the Salinas River and fracking activities will move north.

Barbara Emley

Barbara gave an update on the exempted fishery permit in which she's participating. The fishermen are having an issue with the high observer costs for these small boats and those costs may well interrupt our ability to do the required study for the permit. The boats are small and only collect so much fish, with the cost of the observer at \$475 a day it is hard to avoid going backwards economically.

Clare Waldmann

The Ocean Protection Council (OPC) has a meeting on 2/26; the main action item is the authorizing of a grant to Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Foundation to fund 95 signs to be installed and to continue working in collaboration to decide where other signs should go. The OPC is working on a climate adaptation plan for sea level rise/Ocean Acidification/hypoxia science. A FAQ document for these issues is coming out to correlate with the occurrence of an ocean sciences meeting occurring in Hawaii; it would be great to have a GFNMS person present.

Bruce Bowser

The recent rains had great impacts on Bolinas: they proved that the new Caltrans culverts are collecting the large debris and allowing streams to flow successfully into the lagoon. The sanctuary also met last week with Marin County Parks and Ocean Space about Duxbury Reef and the large school groups using the reef without permits. We talked with the head folks at Marin County Parks to get a permitting process going to prevent this.

Anne Morkill

The SEFI Mouse project's public comment period closed, and we are now in the process of responding and reviewing the EIS. We anticipate having a final EIS by 11/14 or 12/14 which will go before CA Coastal Commission. Once that hearing goes through and they issue a decision, we will then issue a record of decision and submit applications for permits. Summarily, we received 553 individual comments (some new, some duplicative), with 198 in support of no-action and 133 in support of one or the other. 2014 is the 50th anniversary of the Wilderness Act (FNWR's 40th), so there are some outreach and activity opportunities coming up for that.

George Clyde

There was an historic event in Tomales Bay over the last few months: in November we had a red tide event that lasted till January, which is very unusual. This event started in the south part of the bay and brought about an outbreak of paralytic shellfish poisoning, but it didn't come in through the mouth of the Bay. All oyster operations closed down; there is no explanation for the event. The conditions improved and all warnings cancelled, but it was very extraordinary.

Richard Keuhn

Richard lives in Sea Ranch, so he receives a lot of boundary expansion questions. Because of the 14 inches of rain, the Russian/Garcia/Gualala Rivers opened to steelhead this season. He is resuming seabird studies with BLM and noticing cormorants carrying nesting

material earlier than usual (this may be climate change-driven). The sea star die-off is affecting around 60% of the areas Richard observes; we are trying to change septic fields in the Sea Ranch area due to concerns of potential contributions.

Dominique Richard

Dominique was invited to teach a class at American University: Environmental Ethics. During the class he talked about the history of west Marin and the conservation efforts of the area as well. NOAA Headquarters in Washington DC is starting to organize the Annual Chairs Meeting for June.

Public Comment (3)

Soñce Devries, a retired pesticide coordinator for USFWS. She commented on the mouse eradication project on SEFI, stating that no compelling science exists to support the claim of “no impact to seabirds from the use of toxins”. She protests the eradication as it is scheduled during a migratory time for raptors. She also discussed bioaccumulation and other non-poisonous means to resolving the mice issue.

Kelle Kacmarcik, Wildcare. Ms. Kacmarcik opposes the house mouse eradication issue; her primary concerns are the high amount of anticipated wildlife mortality, longevity of poisons, and the insufficient amount of data available on the risks posed to all species.

Maggie Sergio, wildlife rehab and conservation. Ms. Sergio discussed the effects of the proposed poisons on wildlife from firsthand experience. She wrote an article for Huffington Post on the mouse eradication plan and brought copies for the SAC to read. In it she mentions how the EIS omits any details on the toxins’ effects and how the EIS is misleading and inaccurate. She discussed that similar toxic projects occur in New Zealand; the people there reached out to her when this issue received attention to convey their issues with these poisons. She also presented a change.org petition with over 27,000 signatures opposing the eradication project.

LUNCH

ACCESS Cruise Update

The presentation can be viewed at:

http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/14_02/access_ppt.pdf

SW Environmental Response Management Application

Learn about the ERMA platform here:

http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/14_02/sw_erma.pdf

Discussion

Maria observed that there is a lack of information for this region to populate the ERMA. Will this tool be used by the USCG and OSPR? Perhaps USCG can help us answer these questions. Pat Rutten could get some feedback from OSPR, as they seem enthusiastic. Pat will get an access code so the sanctuary can experiment with the tool.

BREAK

Seabird Protection Network Update

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

ADJOURN

Attendance

NAME	SEAT	P/A
Dominique Richard [Council Chair]	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma	P
Richard Kuehn	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma-Alt	P
Kellyx Nelson	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo	P
Tim Duff	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo Alternate	A
Catherine Kuhlman	CA Ocean Protection Council	A
Clare Waldmann	CA OPC Alternate	P
Richard Charter [Council Vice-Chair]	Conservation	P
Bruce Bowser	Conservation Alternate	P
Bob Wilson	Conservation	P
Jackie Dragon	Conservation Alternate	A
Elizabeth Babcock	Education	P
Bibit Traut	Education Alternate	A
Barbara Emley [Council Secretary]	Maritime Activities/ Commercial	P
Peter Grenell	Maritime Activities/Commercial Alternate	P
Mick Menigoz	Maritime Activities/Recreational	A
George Clyde	Maritime Activities/Recreational Alternate	P
John Largier	Research	A
Jaime Jahncke	Research Alternate	P
Cicely Muldoon	National Park Service	P
Frank Dean	National Park Service Alternate	A
Anne Morkill	USFWS	P
Gerry McChesney	USFWS Alternate	A
LT Cody Dunagan	USCG	P
LT Jeannie Crump	USCG Alternate	A
Pat Rutten	NMFS [non-voting]	P
Natalie-Cosentino Manning	NMFS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Maria Brown	GFNMS [non-voting]	P
Chris Mobley	CINMS [non-voting]	A
Mike Murray	CINMS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Dan Howard	CBNMS [non-voting]	P
Michael Carver	CBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Paul Michel	MBNMS [non-voting]	P
Karen Grimmer	MBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	A