



GREATER FARALLONES NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING



Wednesday November 15th, 2017

9:00AM – 4:30PM

San Francisco Zoo, Great Hall

Sloat Blvd at Great Highway

San Francisco, CA 94132

KEY MEETING OUTCOMES

Note: The following notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary, Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary, or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

Sanctuary Advisory Council Members Present: George Clyde, Cea Higgins, Richard Charter, Francesca Koe, Bibit Traut, Barbara Emley, John Largier, Chris Potter (for Jennifer Phillips), Sarah Allen, LT Steve Russo (for Jason Brand), Paul Michel, Dan Howard, Abby Mohan, Bruce Bowser, Dominique Richard, Elizabeth Babcock, Kellyx Nelson,
Quorum – 9 voting members

Copies to:

Bill Douros, ONMS West Coast Regional Office

Call to Order/Review Agenda

The discussion of Marin and Sonoma County recommendations will be switched in the afternoon; Marin recommendations will be presented first.

GFNMS Superintendents Report

Permits

Since the sanctuary expansion, the permit load has increased to about 52 permits this year, almost double previous years.

An education permit was issued to Lawrence Groth of Great White Adventures to attract white sharks at the Farallon Islands for the purposes of conducting educational tours.

An education permit was issued to James Moskito of Shark Diving International to attract white sharks at the Farallon Islands for the purposes of conducting educational tours.

A salvage and recovery permit was issued to Zane Finger of Hog Island Oyster Company for disturbing the seabed to remove and relocate two boat moorings, near Hog Island Oyster Company, Marshall CA, in Tomales Bay, Marin County. The two moorings consist of cement-filled 55-gallon drums with heavy chain and other tackle attached to buoys.

An education permit was issued to Ms. Jane Reifert and Mr. Greg Barron of IA Worldwide Inc. (aka Incredible Adventures) to attract white sharks at the Farallon Islands for the purposes of conducting educational tours.

A research permit was issued to Dr. Richard Starr of Moss Landing Marine Labs to deploy a video lander, which is an underwater camera system, to assess the abundance of fishes and invertebrates in marine areas without conducting extractive sampling. Data from each survey will include geographic coordinates, starting and ending times, fish counts, and species observed. This project is being conducted in collaboration with the Nature Conservancy and NOAA National Marine Fisheries Service.

A research permit was issued to Barbara Block of Stanford University and Sal Jorgensen of Monterey Bay Aquarium to deploy moorings and receivers on the sea floor to track acoustically tagged white sharks and to attract white sharks for tagging, biopsy sampling and photo identification purposes. This work is a continuation of the TOPP program's long-term research program to evaluate and monitor population trends, population biology, migrations, and behaviors of the Northeastern Pacific population of white sharks in both coastal and offshore waters. Permitted fieldwork for this season also includes deploying sail drones, wave gliders and UASs in the sanctuary to collect data on tagged sharks and video imagery.

A salvage and recovery permit was issued to Tim Parker of Parker Diving Services to operate a helicopter below 1,000 feet in a NOAA regulated overflight zone at Point Reyes in order to remove a 31-foot wrecked sailboat, the Cheoy Lee, from the beach near Chimney Rock. The vessel will cut into sections by the salvage crew and rigged for airlift; the helo will then make 2-4 pickups to airlift the pieces across Drakes Bay for drop off at Drakes Beach parking lot.

A research permit was issued to Bob Brodsky of San Andreas Shellfish Company to conduct low overflights using an unmanned aerial system (UAS) to complete a bathymetric survey of eelgrass beds; the survey will measure existing and future density, health, and growth patterns of eelgrass. Surveys will be conducted in collaboration with CDFW and Bodega Marine Lab. The goal of the project is to accurately map eelgrass habitat in order to establish appropriate buffer distances for aquaculture activities in the northeast corner of Tomales Bay.

A research permit was issued to Jan Roletto of Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary to deploy epoxy markers at four different sites on Southeast Farallon Island. The project is a continuation of intertidal monitoring and research that has been conducted on SEFI since 1991. This season staff will replace existing epoxy markers and adding new plots at each site. All sites will be designed to be comparable to mainland intertidal sampling at PRNS, GGNRA, and PISCO sites along the California coast. Data on species will include distribution, percent density, percent cover, and primary and secondary cover and will be used to track the severity of on-going decline in upright algae and mussels, as well as detect presence and severity of disease in sea stars and urchins. These datasets will also be used to provide a baseline dataset for damage assessment from future spills and assess trends and changes from climate change and ocean acidification.

A permit is under review for Dr. Richard Starr of Moss Landing Marine Labs to deploy a video lander on the sea floor, which is an underwater camera system, to assess the abundance of fishes and invertebrates in marine areas without conducting extractive sampling. Amendment 1 is being requested to include additional survey sites with Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary next year.

A permit is under review for Graham Groneman of Marin County Fire Department to use motorized personal watercraft (MPWC) for life-safety and search and rescue training within the sanctuary. The exact areas and seasonal windows in which trainings would be conducted are still being determined.

A permit is under review for Graham Stapelberg and Bill Sharp of World Surf League to use MPWC for the purposes of water safety and contest operations at the annual Mavericks Surfing Event. The event is expected to be held for one day only between December and February when the surf and weather conditions cooperate.

Discussion: The majority of permits issued are for research and most of the education permits are for white shark tourism or academic purposes. Recreational vessels with an education permit are only allowed to use decoys to attract White Sharks. Researchers with a research permit can use scent to attract White Sharks for tagging purposes. There are about three to five shark tourism permits issued for the September to November 15th window; often there may be two boats out but all five could potentially be out at the same time. Part of the sanctuary management plan is to measure how human and vessel presence can affect White Sharks. Point Blue is collecting data on White Sharks and sanctuary staff volunteer to observe the program on-board the tour boats.

Vessel Groundings

A 31-foot sailboat, the Cheoy Lee, went aground on the beach at Point Reyes near Chimney Rock, in Drakes Bay, on October 28, 2017. The vessel owner fortunately was insured and immediately contacted his insurance company, GEICO, who contracted Parker Diving Services to conduct the salvage. Parker was able to locate and remove one 5-gallon fuel tank from the vessel. They do not believe any other pollution threat was onboard. The vessel is in a precarious location on a tiny pocket beach at the foot of a steep bluff. Due to the lack of access points from the landside, Parker will need to remove the vessel using a helicopter. A drop-off point and staging area will be established at Drakes Beach parking lot, which will be closed by Point Reyes National Seashore staff during the salvage operation. The vessel will be cut up and rigged prior to bringing in the helicopter; 2-4 airlifts will likely be needed to then transport the pieces across the Bay to the drop-off site, where the vessel will be crushed with an excavator, loaded in a dump truck, and hauled to a landfill. The salvage operation is expected to be completed this week.

Vessel Speed Reduction (VSR) Update

In collaboration with the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (AQMD) and the National Marine Sanctuary Foundation we enrolled 11 companies in a speed reduction incentive program which resulted in ~\$187,600 being distributed to slow 130 transits (76 SB Channel, 33 SF, 28 Combo transits). For comparison in 2016 we had 882 transits fully cooperating with our voluntary VSR request. This was up from 2015 which 616 transits fully cooperating transits. We think this increase is due to our outreach campaign, and we are looking forward to analyzing the 2017 data to see if the trend continues. The National Marine Sanctuary Foundation has hired a contractor to help us follow up with the industry on our vessel speed reduction efforts, so we can increase the number of vessels that reduce their speed. The ship strike team is currently working

with the National Marine Sanctuary Foundation on how best to recognize companies and organizations that reduce their vessel speeds.

ACCESS Update

Data from the Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS) were used to inform researchers from Point Blue Conservation Science and Cascadia Research Collective about the abundance and distribution of humpback, blue, and fin whales in the sanctuaries. Data were used to produce a nationwide examination of ship strikes and recovery rates of three species of baleen whales prone to being killed by ship strikes. The new publication “High mortality of blue, humpback and fin whales from modeled vessel strikes on the U.S. West Coast” suggests that current efforts to reduce ship strikes to whales is insufficient and that mortality is much higher than once thought. Authors suggest establishment of larger areas to be avoided, re-routing of shipping lanes and seasonal reduction in ship speeds to reduce lethality of ship strikes in areas where re-routing ships is not feasible.

Greater Farallones and Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuaries in partnership with Point Blue Conservation Science completed the 50th Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS) research cruise on September 23-29th, 2017. Sampling included seabird and marine mammal distribution and abundance, zooplankton prey availability, and oceanographic conditions. Highlights included high numbers of large whales compared to the previous September cruises, and good numbers of seabird species that are often uncommon, such as Buller’s shearwaters and Northern Fulmars. Catch in the nets was dominated by pyrosomes, which were reported in record amounts on the Pacific Coast to the north and south earlier this year, and other gelatinous zooplankton. The team was joined by several graduate students who are collecting data for their theses on ocean acidification and whale abundance as part of ACCESS.

Motion to recognize the 50th ACCESS survey and the work of Greater Farallones, Cordell Bank, and Point Blue staff.

On the occasion of the 50th ACCESS survey, the GFNMS Advisory Council recognizes the persistent and professional work of staff at GFNMS, CBNMS and Point Blue and congratulates them on sustaining this invaluable program. Thanks to Ellie Cohen for funding and Jaime Jahncke for data.

Motion: John Largier

Second: Barbara Emley

Unanimous verbal approval

Dan Howard added that the pyrosomes (“sea pickles”) have been showing up along the coast and beaches indicating something may be going on coast wide. Saw them in big numbers in September. We are living in a dynamic time; the biologists on Farallon Islands observed more whales in 2 hours than ever before in 40 years since 1981, approximately 240 whales (mostly humpbacks and blues). This is an indication that things are changing in the ocean. We may not actually be seeing more whales, but we are seeing them feeding more at the islands. NMFS is tracking the population and the NMFS stock assessment can provide information on trends and numbers.

Beach Watch

Conservation Science staff graduated another class of new Beach Watch volunteers. Twenty volunteers will begin surveying 10 beaches, two of which are newly added to the survey program. The new volunteers will continue to receive about 30 more hours of field training through one-on-one mentorships by the Beach Watch staff. With this new class of volunteers, Beach Watch now surveys 58 beaches every two weeks from Point Arena in Mendocino County to Año Nuevo in southern San Mateo County in the northern portion of Monterey Bay sanctuary. Surveys include documentation of live and dead birds and mammals, human activities, oil pollution, entanglement, beach wrack deposition, beach erosion and deposition, and status of streams and lagoons contiguous with the ocean.

Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary Superintendent's Report – Dan Howard, CBNMS Superintendent

Rebecca Holyoke is the new ONMS deputy director and she will be working closely with John Armor. ONMS is combining the northeast and southeast regions into one region. Matt Brookhart will be the acting regional director for that area replacing Reed Bohne when he retires in December.

Holiday festivities will be at Bear Valley Visitor Center again this year, Friday, December 15 at Bear Valley Visitor Center from 5pm-7pm. Please plan to join us – great event to celebrate all we do. Attended by community members, NPS staff, sanctuaries, state parks, foundations and more.

The sanctuary program has submitted responses to the Executive Order 13795 “Implementing an America-First Offshore Energy Strategy,” asking about sanctuaries and monuments that have expanded in the last 10 years. CBNMS provided information that was included in the larger response. We do not know if the administration will release the report to the public. Bill Douros was the lead for this action. Sanctuaries follow a very public process and we feel good about the process that led to our expansion. For questions, contact Commerce Public Affairs at publicaffairs@doc.gov or 202-482-4883.

Cordell Bank and Greater Farallones continue working together on joint resource protection and education issues. This effort has become more important with expansion and reduced budgets.

The recruitment period is open for the Ocean Film Festival in San Francisco – if you know any middle school or high school students have them look on the website and submit a film!

<http://oceanfilmfest.org/student-film-competition>.

Cordell Bank is working with Donna Sandstrom of the Whale Trail about locating some signs in northern California. She received some funding and is looking to install some nice interpretive signage. Sarah Allen noted that state and national parks would be interested in participating. There is an existing list for locations; send suggestions to Carol Preston:

Carol.a.preston@noaa.gov.

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Superintendent's Report – Paul Michel, MBNMS Superintendent

MBNMS held its 25th anniversary event; had lots of public events, speaker series, ocean fair in San Simeon, gala to honor Leon Panetta at Monterey Bay Aquarium. Announced the formation of MBNMS chapter of National Marine Sanctuary Foundation and they are recruiting an executive director. They are starting with a strong board and are working on diversity and fundraising.

Resource Protection is busy on desalination, is the NEPA lead on Cal-Am project. The EIR/EIS should be out late spring; they are expecting controversy. They are also NEPA lead for deep-water desalination for deep ocean intake. Karen Grimmer, MBNMS Resource Protection Coordinator, is involved with the whale entanglement working group; it is opening day for Dungeness crab and there is lots of gear out there.

Starting “First Flush”, 20-year long citizen science program to sample watershed, outfalls, and water quality samples.

The Research team has ship time for Bell Shimada in 2018 for deep-sea exploration, working with Monterey Bay Aquarium Research Institute (MBARI) for planting and transplanting deep-sea coral species and have had success with five species. This research could be helpful for similar issues in the Gulf of Mexico.

MBNMS is responding to black abalone issues in Big Sur. Fifteen acres were lost due to a landslide, which buried black abalone habitat. They are working with NMFS, PISCO and UC Santa Cruz on rescue and recovery efforts.

The Sanctuary Exploration Center is being cleaned; they are working on new exhibits, including a whale exhibit, salmon exhibit, and soundscape exhibit. MBARI has good data on sounds of the ocean. Congrats to MBNMS for getting exhibits at the Center working.

New and updated action plans are being drafted for the MBNMS Management Plan Review. MBNMS Advisory Council has weighed in all but the beach nourishment item. They are hoping to have a draft in spring, and discuss at the next MBNMS Advisory Council meeting on December 15.

USCG Proposed Rule

The tentative US Coast Guard agenda item will not be discussed at this meeting; the release has not cleared the Federal Register at this time. It is anticipated to release next week. This item will be postponed to the winter Advisory Council meeting.

Final Low Overflights Report – Karen Reyna, GFNMS Staff

Karen presented the final changes that sanctuary staff made to the Low Overflights Report incorporating Advisory Council comments and recommendations. Once the Advisory Council approves the final report, it will be forwarded to the sanctuary. The final Low Overflights report

will be posted to the GFNMS website. Commendations to George for chairing the working group.

ACTION: Motion for Sanctuary Advisory Council to approve final Low Overflights report.

Motion: Dominique Richard

Second: Abby Mohan

9 aye

2 abstain

Motion approved

Karen provided updates on implementation of the recommendations. One of the main recommendations was to hire a pilot to help with outreach. Matt Pickett was hired; he is a pilot, a UAS drone pilot, former superintendent, and former NOAA Corps, and has experience working with the military on disturbance to seabirds. Another recommendation was to standardize wording on the website. A group is reviewing wording on all sanctuary websites. The Seabird Protection Network secured funding for a pilot curriculum to provide resources for pilots that are learning to fly in partnership with flight schools.

Paul Hobi is the new Seabird Protection Network Manager. They are working on a partnership with the FAA FAST program to have their presentations be part of the program. With this program, pilots can earn credit towards keeping their license. They have started an outreach campaign where pilots take photos with their planes and the “I fly above 1000 feet” plaque. They have had outreach tabling displays at Cal Pilots “fly-in” and Dream Machines. SPN has distributed over 4,000 posters and pilot products, including annual mailings to pilots and presentations to 2,500 pilots. They also created the Pilots PSA: [Click for video link](#).

BREAK

Student Presentation on Ocean Guardian School Program – Lincoln Middle School

Four 7th and 8th grade students from Jennifer Hartigan’s environmental science class at Lincoln Middle School in Alameda gave a presentation on their Ocean Guardian program activities. They are studying the importance of the ocean and the sanctuary and are part of the NOAA Ocean Guardian School Program. Their projects include litter cleanups, invasive species removals, native plants, and outreach to their school and the public. They have picked up 80 kg of trash, removed invasive plants and planted natives, and presented to the PTA, School Site Council, Alameda School Board, and 900 students at Lincoln.

They were asked about the types of garbage they picked up – it included tires, couches, chairs, litter pickup. They were also asked how they knew which plants were non-native or invasive – their teachers showed them photos. Richard Charter thanked the students for being involved in ocean conservation and Abby congratulated them on public speaking. Thank you to Mrs. Hartigan!

Sanctuary Advisory Council Business

The SAC chairs summit meeting will happen January 16-19, 2018 in San Francisco. It is an opportunity to interact with people at ONMS and other SAC chairs. An idea was proposed to host a social hour/get together for the SAC chairs meeting since it is held in San Francisco. It is also the Federal MPA committee meeting. Abby is interested in helping to plan. Venue ideas include the Inverness Yacht Club or Presidio Yacht Club. Jenn will follow up with Kate at headquarters.

The US Coast Guard proposed rule release is delayed; it should publish in the Federal Register sometime next week. Once it is published, the public comment period would be open until January 15th, 2018. The SAC may want to have a meeting in January before the public comment period ends. The only meeting date available is Wednesday January 10th. Francesca Koe moved to finalize this date. Bibit Traut seconded.

9 aye – **Winter SAC meeting will be held Wednesday January 10th, 2018** (in lieu of February meeting).

Discussion of SAC chairs meeting social event planning will be added to the agenda for next meeting.

Motion to approve meeting minutes from August 16th GFNMS/MBNMS Joint SAC meeting

Motion: Bruce Bowser

Second: Dominique Richard

9 aye

3 abstain

Motion approved

Discussion regarding draft minutes: Suggestion to have an internal review period for SAC members to review. Moving forward, we will give a window of a week to send the draft minutes for internal SAC review, then they will be publicly posted still in draft form until approval at the next meeting. This particular meeting may take longer due to holiday leave.

Discussion regarding voting matters: Moving forward, we will no longer count votes by raised hands; voting will be by voice unless a member requests a count, if there may be opposition, or the issue needs more attention.

SAC Member Recruitment and SAC Retreat

In July, the new Advisory Council member recruitment process was decided where vacancies can be advertised as they open and are not bound to a quarterly application period. However, the *Federal Register* notice stating this new process must be published in order for this process to take effect. As of this week, it has not been cleared or published, so we cannot post open vacancies yet. As of the end of October, there are eight members whose three-year terms have expired, though they have been asked to remain in their current seats through this transition process. Once the *Federal Register* notice is published, the vacancies can be officially announced and applications accepted. The two seats that were vacant prior to July (Mendocino/Sonoma Alternate, Youth Alternate) are eligible to receive applications. The initial deadline for these applications is November 30. We received one application for the youth seat

and have interest from others, so we will set up the call with the review subcommittee (Bibit, Elizabeth, Francesca, Dominique).

The SAC retreat is scheduled for Wednesday, December 6 from 9am to 7pm at the Sanctuary offices at 991 Marine Drive in the Presidio. We will be reviewing the 2017 Accomplishments, developing the 2018 Workplan, and setting the 2018 meeting schedule. We will also have presentations from Karen Reyna and Jan Roletto on the sanctuary's benthic habitat goals, findings from the 2016 Nautilus cruise, hear about the Deep Sea Coral curriculum from the Education team and do a hands-on ROV activity, followed by a reception with Greater Farallones staff and dinner in the Presidio.

Member Reports

Dominique Richard: Went on ACCESS cruise in September, had nice weather and saw whales.

Francesca Koe: Attended Our Ocean conference in Malta; happy to report 7.2 billion euros pledged for ocean conservation; 2.5 square km were designated as marine protected areas. Had 437 commitments from delegations; there are great actions happening; recognition from leadership, overall a positive conference. Mark your calendars for March 13, Oceans Day in Sacramento. If interested in participating let Francesca know. She is hosting a visitor from Japan who holds the world record for self-propelling deep sea diving.

Richard Charter: The Senate of Energy and Natural Resources Committee is voting to open the Arctic Wildlife Natural Refuge. It would give the ability to hold a lease sale on the Outer Continental Shelf, and California could be added at any time. He was in Arizona and Utah for 2 weeks and it is clear that the Grand Staircase-Escalante Monument and Bears Ears National Monument may be reduced with carve outs for drilling. Northeast Canyons and Northwest Hawaiian Islands Monuments may lose fishing restrictions. Twenty seven monuments were reviewed and results should be announced first week of December. The overall trend is not looking good.

Paul Michel: Monterey is doing microplastics surveys and ocean observing and there may be potential for partnerships.

Bruce Bowser: Kent Island restoration project ended after 5 years. Marin County removed PVC piping on island used for saltwater irrigation. If present wave action is indication, there is movement of the channel with waves cutting straight,

Barbara Emley: It is opening day of crab season; the weather may be daunting. Saw a drawing of the wind machines for deep water; it is a floating device with three cables anchoring in place.

John Largier yielded his time.

Abby Mohan: Sailed 30 foot boat to Farallon Islands. Had good conditions and a fun time.

Francesca Koe for Josh Russo: Josh has been trying to organize volunteer divers to reduce urchin sprawl. He is waiting for California Dept of Fish & Wildlife to issue permits so they can do so.

Bibit Traut: Students were asking about the urchin removal and would love to be volunteers for the program. Attended Sharktoberfest at the sanctuary, a great event. Elizabeth Babcock was there with Cal Academy of Sciences. She is working with LiMPETS, to pilot the new sand crab sampling program and they are going to Fitzgerald Marine Reserve soon.

Sarah Allen: Cicely Muldoon is returning to Point Reyes. There is a new superintendent for GGNRA, Laura Joss. Park projects include a new Alcatraz embarkation and the Crissy Field improvement. The general management plan draft for Point Reyes is out for comment including grazing land management with a range of alternatives and a court approved settlement agreement; there was an agreement of the parties, which is a good sign. The ship removal off Drakes Beach took place and they had a biological monitor. The Tomales Bay Watershed Council meeting is taking place today.

Cea Higgins: The Sonoma County fires impacted people inland and the coast became a sanctuary for many people. It was affirmation for preserving the coast for human health; there were temporary shelters on the coast and thousands of people trying to escape smoke. There are efforts now to use “waddles” to inject mycelium to reduce and prevent toxins from the fires entering waterways and the ocean.

Chris Potter: In September Governor Brown signed Senate bill 5, “California Drought, Water, Parks, Climate, Coastal Protection, and Outdoor Access For All Act of 2018”. It will be on the ballot next June and would issue bonds for \$4 billion dollars for financing projects related to these programs.

George Clyde: Mentioned the Tomales Bay Vessel Management Plan; his buoy was inspected.

Kellyx Nelson: The state budget mentioned by Chris would address the Pescadero Marsh salmon habitat process. The project to dredge the Pescadero marsh is moving forward.

Marin/Sonoma Regional Sediment Management Plan Working Group

Cea Higgins, working group chair for the Marin/Sonoma Regional Sediment Management Working Group, thanked the sanctuary staff team who assisted with the working group: Doug George, Sara Hutto, Max Delaney, Jenn Gamurot, Sage Tezak. She introduced Doug George to give background on the Marin/Sonoma Regional Sediment Management Plan.

Background on Marin/Sonoma Regional Sediment Management Plan—Doug George, Greater Farallones Association

Doug gave background information on the Sediment Management Plan, including the goals, players, project setting, coastal classifications, land ownership, preliminary sediment budget, local, state, and federal planning stages, challenges. He also reviewed the project timeline, working group process and membership, and the development of the recommendations. The plan completion target is February 2018 and will include sediment science, physical processes, geological setting, biological resources, governance considerations, recommendations for sediment management activities, and a story map.

The objective of the meeting was to discuss, edit, and vote on three sets of recommendations: regional, specific to Marin County, and specific to Sonoma County. He clarified the recommendation terminology listed on the recommendation spreadsheets.

The project has engaged with Caltrans for certain locations such as Gleason Beach in Sonoma. They aim to engage with private landowners and Resource Conservation Districts as well.

PUBLIC COMMENT

John Bowling: Jetski enforcement is becoming a bigger issue. There is absolutely no enforcement at Mavericks surf break in Half Moon Bay. The company that operated Mavericks Surf Competition went bankrupt and now a company from Australia has acquired the contest. They run their operations off media content. There has been a huge onslaught of jet skis, drones, and boats. He has contacted one of the law enforcement officers who is at his wits end trying to manage from San Diego to northern California. He has asked to make the Mavericks area a priority for law enforcement. The community has witnessed desecration of the sanctuary, including unchecked development, pollution, and destruction. The waves broke 65 times last year, and the increased influx of people is disrupting wildlife and creating a lot of foot traffic; they are seeing trampling happening on reefs and tide pools. We may lose control of the situation this year because the media is pushing for absolute commercialization of the waves. There are a lot of others that feel this way and strongly feel that it must be protected.

Bud Buchanan: Professor of geography and is visiting sanctuaries to experience the communities. Volunteers with Flower Garden Banks National Marine Sanctuary. Supportive of the hard work that the SAC does.

LUNCH

Regional Sediment Management Recommendations

NOTE: Numbering of recommendations was changed at the meeting.

Discussion

1. Would toxins be mentioned in the report? Document invasive species that we would not want to move around? Doug mentioned the sand compatibility analysis - biological process/protocols that EPA/water board have established which captures invasive species.
2. No discussion
3. Richard noted that it was good to mention the first part of three “Recognizing that the Working Group and the Sanctuary do not have the authority to prescribe or recommend managed retreat at specific locations along the coast”.
4. Discussion around defining armoring (was #4 now #6)
5. No discussion
6. Landslides can create regulatory issues. The question becomes if dredging or recovering it for reuse will suspend sediment. Just use “consider”. Noted that most of sediment is put in land dumps. Would like to qualify in an ecological context, could that be incorporated somehow? “For beneficial reuse within an ecological context?” Incorporating best

ecological practices. Because there are multiple stakeholders, beneficial may mean different things. Define beneficial reuse.

7. Elizabeth noted it is a basic principle that should be higher on the list; guiding principle. Moved to #2. Re-sort strategies based on level of “meta”.
8. (now #9) Suggestion to change to the word “promote”. Looking at models at what is successful that are working such as the Marin RCD that has a permit coordination system.
9. No discussion
10. The state working group should identify what “success” looks like. Chris Potter from California Natural Resources Agency noted that the plan would live within the region. The sanctuary could potentially be the “sponsor”, if they are willing to adopt the plan. Adoption of a plan opens the door to funding from different avenues from the state. There are grant programs to support, as sediment management is a priority for the state. Francesca recommends sponsorship for the plan as it is in the interest of the sanctuary.
11. No discussion
12. Needs bookmark for a deadline. “Final submission of plan” added.
13. Recognizing that there is ongoing work and ensuring that we eliminate redundancies and learn from other projects. “Coordinate with other sediment management work”
14. Shift mentality to “developing and engaging stakeholders”, helping to figure out the ways they would like to be involved; rally support around the plan; encourage buy-in, opportunities to join sediment management efforts. Could potentially lead to private funding sources. Discussion for TMDLs- some agencies are addressing sediment as a pollutant.

*Added new recommendation #3 – *Prioritize positive incentives and technical assistance to accomplish landscape level restoration of soil health and reduced sedimentation through voluntary stewardship, consulting and seeking partnerships with local Resource Conservation Districts, Land Trusts, NGOs, property owner associations, etc.*

*Add to regional recommendation #7 (now #2) – *Cross-reference connected systems (Dillon beach north/south, Russian River, Tomales Bay)*

*Potential recommendation to add once SAC reviews plan – *The sanctuary should advance/host/sponsor the plan; continued involvement would ensure that the plan would be successful.*

The SAC would like to review the draft plan. Once the draft is completed, it will be circulated and revisited at the January 10th SAC meeting.

Doug clarified that the findings of the working group were the recommendations and the working group itself was not assessing permitting efficiencies; permitting efficiency was defined as a need in the working group. Discussion of the current permitting world has not evolved; there are current and standard perspectives such as viewing sediment as a pollutant. There will be a glossary of the terms in the plan and the recommendations are solely a piece of the entire plan. The plan is a menu of options and not meant to be prescriptive; it provides potential solutions to a range of problems. This body has been engaged in work like this in the past; it reinforces the community engagement procedure.

Kellyx gave background on Resource Conservation Districts. There are many opportunities to partner with the RCDs. A model that has worked is the MBNMS Agricultural and Rural Lands Action Plan, which launched the rural roads program. Consider voluntary restoration over regulatory approach. RCD is more of an activist group and raises money, therefore, they are a powerful ally. Mentioning the RCDs would be worthwhile. Landowners are aware of the RCDs; there are diverse ways of getting information to the landowners. Recommend to collaborate with RCDs and developing programs in support of RCDs.

There was a suggestion to call out that we need coastal watershed analyses especially because of the fires. However, in Sonoma County, the coastal zone is defined by the coastal range, though we can still recommend the right approach.

Action: The SAC adopts these regional recommendations as amended.

Motion: Kellyx Nelson

Second: Bruce Bowser

Unanimous approval to adopt recommendations as amended.

The term “regulatory feasibility” was addressed. Kellyx recommended changing the term “regulatory feasibility” to different wording such as “permitting feasibility”, removing “regulations” altogether.

The years and strategies were clarified; they were using the “low hanging fruit approach”; the timeline may depend on the timing of some of the issues.

There was a suggestion to streamline the wording of the classification system of the seven goals and 10 strategies in the report.

Max Delaney clarified that all the government agencies had consensus on the categories during the first Technical Advisory Committee meeting. They discussed the roles that each agency would have for the categories and feasibility would be addressed at a later time. There was a suggestion to add a definition for “feasibility” under current authorities and agency regulatory language and whether permitting is feasible or not into the glossary.

Kellyx recommended changing the term to “feasibility” and adding a footnote with the recommendation terminology and using a flowchart to help landowners and recognize private property rights.

Cea reviewed the recommendation terminology that was listed on the spreadsheets and in Doug’s presentation.

Marin County Sediment Management Recommendations

Kellyx suggested annotating all spreadsheets to include the RCDs and other agencies that are working on these projects.

Muir Beach: Sarah Allen suggested adding “federally listed species” to concerns. This is a restoration site that is still unfolding and processes are still happening; monitoring restoration efforts at the lagoon and the outfall.

Stinson Beach: Lots of studies done under the Marin Local Coastal Plan; working group deferred to the plan.

Bolinas Lagoon: No discussion

Bolinas Cliffs: No discussion

Duxbury Reef: The concern would be that it is a potential source of sediment that may not be accessible due to regulatory constraints. Suggestion to rephrase as an opportunity: “The graben of deep sediment for beach nourishment is an opportunity; however, accessing it is a problem because it is deep”.

Point Reyes: Add federally listed species

Bivalve: Add marsh

Inverness: Bruce Bowser noted that there are many projects going on. Road slumping, undercut.

Chicken Ranch: Add note from Tom Gaman into the notes column.

Marshall: No discussion

Dillon Beach South: Suggestion to restate the issues to clarify what the actual sediment management issues are that we trying to address. Dune activity is compromising coastal access and preserving natural resources.

Dillon Beach North: There are sediment as well as social issues. Suggestion to combine with Dillon Beach South to become a system. Concerns and issues: Look at potential holistic approach with Dillon Beach South and link the two. Apply this to Tomales Bay also.

Estero San Antonio: Consider presence of listed species; sediment info on tidewater goby

Estero Americano: Goldridge RCD has done work. Add species of concern.

Kellyx noted that there would be heavy use of emissions with equipment operations for some recommendations. Consider that recommendations should be consistent regarding climate, e.g., reducing carbon output from restoration, considering the amounts of trucks and equipment and their carbon emissions. Suggestion to add a value statement about climate that is consistent

across policies and considers the carbon footprint of these activities. This could potentially influence the sanctuary's decision whether to move forward with certain recommendations.

Tomales Bay: There are multiple issues going on at Tomales Bay, including long-term impacts of "back passing" at Chicken Ranch Beach. Mitigation banking could be an option. There was a suggestion to use a watershed approach to Tomales Bay ("bay-shed approach") which considers hydrologic issues in the bay's watershed. For overall Tomales Bay, there should be consistency with approaches across recommendations.

Sarah Allen proposed to add a location: Drakes Beach and visitor center. Proposed restoration to take out parking lot and connect the wetland. It would help Point Reyes to have it on the list. It was determined the location was not in the sanctuary and it was not added to the list.

Action: The SAC adopts these recommendations as amended for Marin County.

Action: Verbal Aye.

Motion approved with SAC member input and edits.

Sonoma County Sediment Management Recommendations

Doran Park: No discussion

Bodega Harbor: Invasive species may be a concern with reuse of sediment. The US Army Corps of Engineers includes a sediment study; the plan would follow guidelines for reuse of sediments.

Bodega Head: Noted as a coastal erosion hotspot with cliffs

Gleason Beach: The sanctuary has a lot of permitting and sediment management and discharge issues at this beach, including armoring falling into the sanctuary.

Sonoma Beach: Goat Rock Beach will have impacts to estuary; Sonoma County Water Agency will be impacted. There were no short-term measures proposed for Goat Rock. Suggestion to link this proposal for management plan of Russian River Estuary and north Goat Rock parking area.

Russian River: There were many references to ordinances in Sonoma County and acknowledgement of the existing work. Suggestion to add into notes or strategy detail: "support existing efforts to manage upstream issues". Refer to habitat blueprint ongoing projects. Consult with Sonoma County Water Agency as lead agency for river mouth management.

Driftwood Beach: Discussion on the terminology of "social" trails and "volunteer" trails.

Gerstle Cove: Recommendation was to protect the visitor center, salt collecting at salt point, and the doghole port and document these cultural resources before they are lost. The working group attempted to involve tribes in participation, and recognition of cultural resources on the north coast was brought forward. The connection between sediment and cultural resources is unclear. It appears the land is used as subsistence usage for salt and ceremonial purposes. Suggestion to

remove “managed retreat” and change management strategy to TBD. Recommendation to consult internally and externally with tribes.

Fort Ross: The Fort may be far enough away, though there is a house on a bluff and the campground area close to coast. Strategies other than managed retreat should be considered after consultations with tribes. Noted that there was representation from California State Parks on the working group.

Sea Ranch: Parts of the coastal trail are falling into the ocean. Some of it fell with public access. This location was brought up by Sonoma County Regional Parks. There is significant erosion and signs are falling. Suggestion to work with Sea Ranch homeowners association. An agency would need to make easements on the land, such as private property owners and regional parks or public land agencies to address coastal access points. Added into notes: “Requires additional consultation with property owners. May want to consider as an additional recommendation; consult with Sea Ranch community to explore alternatives to managed retreat and create strategies. Add as a separate strategy within the Sea Ranch tab.

Recommendation to add “consultation of property owners” for all locations into the notes column; example if there are homeowner’s associations. May want to provide information on sanctuary regulations.

Gualala: No discussion

One thing that the working group did not consider is that these actions need to consider their climate/carbon footprint. Suggestion that the report should acknowledge it. Possibility to create an additional recommendation to ensure all policies are consistent with carbon emissions guidelines.

Next steps: Modify language to include communities, look at existing authorities, and clarify the role that the sanctuary will play within the plan. Clean up and refine the language, concerns and issues, and make management goals consistent. The information from the SAC will be used to write the report. The SAC requested to review the report. The sanctuary will present the draft report at the January 10 SAC meeting for member review and comment. Goal to finish plan and send it to the state by February 1, 2018.

Action: The SAC adopts these recommendations as amended for Sonoma County.

Action: Verbal Aye.

Motion approved with SAC member input and edits.

ADJOURN 4:30pm