



# GREATER FARALLONES NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

Wednesday February 27<sup>th</sup>, 2019 9:50AM – 4:15PM  
Bodega Bay Fire Protection District Firehouse  
510 Highway 1, Bodega Bay, CA  
MEETING HIGHLIGHTS



Note: The following notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

**Sanctuary Advisory Council Members Present:** George Clyde, Cea Higgins, Richard Charter, Francesca Koe, John Largier, Dan Howard, Abby Mohan, Dominique Richard, Elizabeth Babcock, Joshua Russo, Ben Becker, Jaime Jahncke, Cicely Muldoon, Nancy Trissel  
Quorum – 8 voting members

**Copies to:** Bill Douros, ONMS West Coast Regional Office

Call to Order 9:50am

Review Agenda

Introduction of Alayne Chappell as the new Sanctuary Advisory Council Coordinator.

Moved approval of key meeting outcomes agenda item to Sanctuary Advisory Council business.

Six seat changes are pending approval of ONMS headquarters:

- 3 new members and 3 seat changes including: Conservation (alternate) Community-at-large for San Mateo and San Francisco (primary and alternate for each), Commercial Fishing (primary and alternative), and Maritime Commercial (primary).

## **Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary Superintendent's Report**

Maria Brown, Sanctuary Superintendent

[View the report.](#)

### **5th Ocean Climate Summit**

GFNMS and the Greater Farallones Association are hosting their 5th Ocean Climate Summit on April 18, 2019 at the Fort Mason General's Residence in San Francisco. The first climate summit took place in 2008 and then roughly every 2 years since. This year's theme is "Learning from the Past, Looking to the Future" and will bring together colleagues from across California to identify collective actions to advance climate science, communication, and adaptation for the north-central California coast and ocean.

Activities will include an update on the State of the Science, and sessions including: Ocean Acidification: Impacts and Response, Focus on Habitats to Support Climate Resilience, Coastal Protection Designs for Living Shorelines, Building Resilience through Multi-stressor Management, and Community engagement to advance climate action. The goal of the Summit is to discuss the focus of ocean climate efforts for the next ten years.

*Comment: Dan Howard would like to commend GFNMS on their climate activity over the last ten years. Maria thanked Dan and acknowledged that the GFNMS Advisory Council has been instrumental in informing the sanctuary's actions. Other members commented that GFNMS has been ahead of its time in respect to ocean climate action.*

### **International Ocean Film Festival**

The 16th annual International Ocean Film Festival (IOFF) is coming up March 7-10th at the Cowell Theater in San Francisco. (*Maria handed out IOFF schedules.*) It features films from around the world, covering diverse ocean-related topics. The sanctuary was one of the founding members of the festival, and have been on the board and screening committee, as well as submitted films. This year, the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries has a couple films entered.

A GFNMS-produced short documentary about the 25th Anniversary of the Beach Watch program will premiere at the festival on Saturday, March 9th at 10am. The film celebrates the sanctuary's long-term scientific monitoring of our coastal margins, and our partnership with the public as citizen scientists; and is this year's winner of the Citizen Science Award. Sanctuary media specialist, MJ Schramm is the writer and producer of the film. Also playing will be: *Near Miss*, featuring Ron Elliot's 2017 shark encounter at the Farallon Islands; *Salty Generation*, about Tomales Bay aquaculture will be playing; *Protecting Blue Whales and Blue Skies*, which is about the incentive program to reduce whale strikes that Channel Islands NMS leads with GFNMS and CBNMS; and *Every 9 Minutes*, which is about the blue whale sculpture that is in front of the Greater Farallones office.

### **Federal Government Furlough Impacts**

The furlough did impact the sanctuary's work, and did impact this meeting. There were a number of things that were in our workplan that were planned for this meeting that were unable to be presented. One of them was the Tomales Bay Native Oyster Working Group, which will be discussed during SAC business later today. The sanctuary's response to the Kelp Recovery Working Group's recommendations has also been delayed and will now be presented later in the year, likely at the May meeting. The sanctuary's naturalist course was delayed, but thanks to hard work from the education team, they are moving forward with the course. The course was sold out with a waitlist so it was a good showing.

In general, we are in the process of catching up from the furlough. We are anticipating the same amount of funding this year as last year.

### **Bureau of Ocean Energy Management (BOEM) Memo to West Coast Region (WCR)**

In response to BOEM's Call for Information and Nomination for Commercial Leasing for Wind Power Development on the Outer Continental Shelf, the West Coast Region took the lead on submitting a comment letter on behalf of all the West Coast sanctuaries, and in cooperation with the National Marine Fisheries Service. Maria drafted and sent a memo to Bill Douros, WCR Director, summarizing key points from the Sanctuary Advisory Council's meeting and discussion in November on the subject matter. Maria will forward the ONMS comment letter.

### **Caltrans Comment Letter**

George Clyde had brought up during the Nov. 2018 meeting that Caltrans had put out a call for information from certain agencies on their north-central coast plans. Caltrans had not contacted the sanctuary, so GFNMS submitted a letter saying we want to be engaged and work with them on their projects along the coast. Subsequently, Caltrans announced they will do boarder outreach to more agencies for input.

### **Tomales Bay Oyster Aquaculture Permit**

A request was made for Maria to send a notice out to the SAC about the Tomales Bay Oyster Company's request for a retroactive permit from the California Coastal Commission. At this time the permit has not gone to the California Department of Fish and Wildlife for their review. The SAC requests to be informed of all aquaculture permit applications for Tomales Bay.

### **Update on Kelp Recovery timeline**

The Council reviewed and approved the Bull Kelp Recovery Working Group recommendations at the November meeting. Since then, steps have been taken to initiate a Bull Kelp Recovery Program coordinated by Greater Farallones Association staff. The first action of the program was to prepare a comprehensive report detailing potential recovery sites and methods. The sanctuary planned to request the Greater Farallones Association present the findings from this report to the Council at this meeting. However, due to the government furlough, the report timeline was pushed back to provide opportunity for federal and state review of the SAC recommendations. The sanctuary will 1) request the Association to present their Kelp Recovery Action Plan as well 2) plan to respond to the SAC recommendations at the May 22nd meeting.

### **Conservation Science Update**

Conservation Science staff hosted the annual meeting of the MPA Watch network participants. MPA Watch is a citizen-science monitoring program that trains volunteers to observe and collect data on human uses of coastal and marine resources inside and outside of marine protected areas (MPA). Volunteers use standardized protocols to collect relevant, scientifically rigorous, and broadly accessible data. The sanctuary Beach Watch program provides data to the MPA Watch database. The annual meeting reviewed funding sources and future proposals, updated guidelines on data collection, data management, quality control of data and adherence to protocols, identified potential data users and management information needs and consistent reporting format and data interpretation for management actions.

Conservation science staff are planning for upcoming ACCESS cruises and have requested funding with CBNMS for three cruises this year in May, July and September. Due to setbacks from the recent government furlough, research staff had to cancel their planned rocky intertidal sampling on the Southeast Farallon Island and will reschedule sampling for February 2020.

Beach Watch staff are planning to hold new volunteer recruitment and training for volunteers to monitor beaches in the southern portion of our range.

### **Sanctuary Heritage Update**

Since 2016, we have been publishing Facebook posts on the anniversary of our most infamous sanctuary shipwrecks, among which are the USS Conestoga, USS Independence, Tanker Puerto Rican, SS Jacob Luckenbach, SS City of Chester, SS City of Rio de Janeiro, and M/V Cosco Busan. These posts target an audience interested in maritime history and invite them to learn more about Maritime Heritage in the sanctuary on our website. The practice of using social media in this manner is based on best practice by the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries.

### **Vessel Grounding, Incidents**

The following incident was not included in the previous superintendent's report given that it took a long time to resolve. On October 30, 2017, an abandoned recreational sailing vessel in Tomales Bay, called the Otta, was reported to GFNMS staff. GFNMS reported the case to NOAA Office of Law Enforcement (OLE) that same week and requested assistance with tracking down the responsible party to remove it. OLE boarded the vessel in early 2018 and found no ownership records or CF number. At this point, the vessel had become unsecured, was splitting along her hull and decks, had heavy marine growth, was covered in bird feces and had no sails, and was an imminent threat the sanctuary. OLE proceeded to work with members of the community to attempt to identify and make contact with the responsible party over the following months with no success.

As OLE was working on a plan to take possession of the vessel and salvage it, the Marin County Sheriff's Department came forward and offered to help remove it using 2017 grants funds they received from the

Surrendered and Abandoned Vessel Exchange (SAVE) program. Administered by the California State Parks Division of Boating and Waterways (DBW), SAVE grant funds are awarded annually to qualified local public agencies statewide to 1) remove abandoned vessels on their private property, 2) surrender vessels through the Vessel Turn-In Program that they have title to, and/or 3) remove hazardous marine debris. Marin County Sheriff's Department was able to successfully remove and properly dispose of the Otta on July 17, 2018.

### **OLE Update**

OLE has hired a new agent for the Santa Rosa Office, who is expected to start active duty on March 4, 2019. Don Tanner will plan to introduce him during a future SAC meeting as his training schedule permits.

### **Permits**

We are still working on the matrix to be disseminated prior to SAC meetings and will have that ready for SAC members prior to the May meeting. Current permits and permit requests are as follows:

- Permit issued to Maria Brown and Paul Michel for renewing MBNMS/GFNMS joint Superintendent's permit (after going through a NEPA analysis) to do work in the northern management area conducting activities that promote the health of the sanctuary resources. The permit will be valid from January 31, 2019 – 2023.
- Under review: Suzanne Olyarnik from Bodega Marine Lab (BML), blanket permit for all the activities proposed by Bodega Marine Lab along the sanctuary coastline.
- Still under review: Marin County Fire Department for use of personal watercraft for safety, they want to conduct a training which has not yet been scheduled.
- Incredible Adventures is appealing their permit to request use of chum, sound, and scent attractions for white sharks (they have appealed eight times).

**Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Superintendent's Report** – No report.

### **Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary Superintendent's Report**

Dan Howard, Sanctuary Superintendent

- Deputy Superintendent Michael Carver's detail to Florida Keys NMS has been extended for another 120 days. He will return to CBNMS mid-June.
- Jenny Stock (CBNMS Education and Outreach Coordinator) on detail with Point Reyes National Seashore for 6 months.
- Dani Lipski (CBNMS Research Coordinator) hired a biological assistant (paid from last year's base budget). The new hire just started on Monday and the position is funded through the end of this fiscal year.
- Indonesian upper marine management professionals visited GFNMS and CBNMS on Monday, February 25<sup>th</sup>. They are in the process of implementing marine protected areas (MPAs) in Indonesia and wanted to learn from US sanctuaries. Their visit was organized through the Office of NOAA's Marine Protected Areas Center. The group from Indonesia also visited GFNMS and are headed to Monterey Bay and Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuaries as well.

## Sanctuary Advisory Council Business

### **ACTION: Approve November Meeting Key Outcomes**

**No changes needed.**

**First: Francesca Koe**

**Second: Abby Mohan**

**Unanimous vote in favor of approving the November 2018 meeting highlights as they are.**

**Key Outcomes approved.**

Tomales Bay Native Oyster Working Group update (Alayne Chappell, SAC Coordinator is giving update in Working Group Chair, Bibit Traut's absence)

- First meeting that was scheduled for Jan. 28<sup>th</sup> was canceled due to the federal government shutdown. The meeting was rescheduled for March 15<sup>th</sup>. The second meeting is scheduled for May 15<sup>th</sup>.
- Due to this setback, the Working Group recommendations will not be presented at the May 22 meeting as planned, but instead will be presented to the Council at the August 15<sup>th</sup> meeting.
- Julia Royster (on detail from NOAA's Restoration Center) is working 50% on this project and will work from the GFNMS offices when in town.

### SAC member recruitment (**ACTION**)

- Established an Application Review Panel for open seats: Maritime Activities Commercial alternate and Conservation alternate seats, currently advertised.
  - Francesca and Dominique have volunteered to review applications for these seats (**ACTION: Francesca Koe and Dominique Richard will serve as the Application Review Panel for the current recruitment**)
- There is now a Commercial Fishing seat. Two other candidates for the Community at Large SF/San Mateo seats are awaiting final approval. We hope to invite them for the May 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting.
- John Berge stays as in Maritime Commercial primary.
- Maritime Recreation seat encompasses consumptive and non-consumptive activities (eco tours, charter boats, etc.).
- The SAC requested the sanctuary send the maritime seat announcement to the pilots association and harbor masters.

### Officer nominations (**ACTION**)

- Alayne passed out ballots for everyone to vote anonymously.
- John (current Chair) and Dominique (current Vice Chair) are termed out in these roles but can be voted into other officer roles. Barbara can continue as secretary if voted in again. Nominations include: Dominique for chair, Abby and Bruce are nominated for the vice chair, write-ins available for all seats.
- **Results:** Dominique Richard will be the new Chair (can serve two consecutive 2-year terms), Abby Mohan will be the new Vice Chair (can serve two consecutive 2-year terms), and Barbara Emely remains secretary (no limit on consecutive terms).

### 2019 Advisory Council Retreat

- This year's theme is the Sanctuary-San Francisco Bay connection

- Proposed retreat location: SF State Estuary & Ocean Science Center (EOS) in Tiburon
- Proposed date: TBD in October 2019
- Morning of the retreat will be dedicated to reviewing 2019 accomplishments, developing the work plan for 2020. Tour of EOS in the afternoon; followed by panel discussions open to the public.
- Suggested topics: oceanography (mixing waters, OA, Hypoxia, sediment), pollution (chemicals/nutrients, plastics and micro-plastics), wildlife (marine mammals, sharks, seabirds), recreation/commercial activities (boats, harbors, fishing, etc.)
- Possibility of a tour to Richardson Bay and Audubon and then dinner.

### **Presentation: Education Activities in the GFNMS Expansion Area**

Carol Preston, GFNMS Education Coordinator

[Presentation available here.](#)

Carol gave a presentation on education activities taking place in the Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary expansion area into Sonoma and Mendocino Counties, established in 2015. Over the past 3 years, 903 students were engaged in the expansion area through the Sanctuary education blitz program. The LiMPETS program (Long-term Monitoring Program and Experiential Training) expanded north with two new rocky shore sites and two new sandy beach sites. Oceans After School youth programs are also being executed in the expansion area. Two ocean film festivals have been hosted at Point Arena theater, and annual sanctuary explorations are held in the expansion area.

MaryJane Schramm (GFNMS Media and Outreach Specialist) has written 24 articles for community publications based in the expansion area (e.g., Sonoma Coast and Marin Coast Guide). (Carol distributed examples of these publications to members). All work has been accomplished without any additions to staff or base funds for programs.

Cea Higgins, Community-at-Large member for Sonoma/Mendocino, noted that the sanctuary has more presence in Gualala (Lost Coast area) and that it's wonderful there is more sanctuary education in this area where they don't have a lot of resources but the coast and ocean is such a big part of the local culture.

### **Presentation: Deep Sea Coral R/V *Bell Shimada* Cruise**

Jan Roletto, GFNMS Research Coordinator

Jan gave a presentation on and shared video and images from the 2018 deep-sea coral cruise aboard NOAA's *Bell Shimata* to survey the seafloor and record images of deep sea habitats at various sites in Greater Farallones, Cordell Bank, and Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuaries. The team included sanctuary staff (Greater Farallones and Cordell Bank), NOAA, a team from Marine Applied Research & Exploration (MARE), Cal Academy, and Greater Farallones Association. Mapping was done by NOAA's Office of Coast Survey. The remotely operated vehicle (ROV) (*Beagle*), was provided by MARE. Gary Williams (Invertebrate Zoology and Geology Curator at the California Academy of Sciences) was aboard collecting samples. Jan notes that it was a great partnership among the groups involved.

The research team saw a Six gill shark, a Wolf eel, hydrocorals, lots of rock fish and sponges, and more. Reef building corals, rockfish, and basket stars were abundant. Identification/analysis is not yet done and they are looking for funding to complete analyses from the cruise. Gary Williams is looking at the taxonomy.

They also saw a lot of debris on the seafloor, including inactive fishing line, soda cans, lots of old gillnet, plastic, anchors (not always intentionally dumped). An Essential Fish Habitat (EFH) designation is proposed for Pescadero reef and Pigeon Point reef areas. Marine debris is higher around Pigeon Point reef, and Jan noted that the sanctuary maybe seeking funds cleanup.

The cruise also went to Cochrane Bank (rocky feature in GFNMS) to finish characterizing the area as it was last explored in 2012.

Discussion around marine debris and trawling issues followed Jan's presentation. Abby Mohan asked whether there is anything the Advisory Council can do to help with the marine debris issue. Jan indicated that Karen Reyna (GFNMS Resource Protection Coordinator) has been providing information on these areas to inform the NMFS's Essential Fish Habitat (EFH) process (e.g., Cochran Bank, Pigeon Point, and Pescadero reef are all pending EFH status). The Environmental Impact Statements (EIS) has not been published for public comment yet. John Largier asked whether there is currently bottom trawling happening in these areas. Jan indicated that there is bottom trawling in these areas; for example, there is bottom trawling at 90 meters in Cochran Bank. Francesca Koa asked how the National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) decides where to open and close for trawling. Jan indicated that NMFS first completes an EIS, which can take 6-8 years. Maria Brown indicated that Cochran Bank was a new discovery by the sanctuary; and that Cochran Bank and Rittenburg Bank are proposed for EFHs.

***PUBLIC COMMENT*** – *No public comment*

***LUNCH***

### **Member Reports**

***George Clyde, Community at Large Marin*** – In the 1960s and 70s, there was an effort to reintroduce salmon into Walker Creek, which flows into Tomales Bay. In the 1980s, ranchers started to better manage land practices along the creek beds, and have put in more than 1 million dollars toward creek restoration. This year, they had 34 Coho salmon in the creek, this is the largest return they have seen since restoration efforts began.

***Cea Higgins, Community at Large Mendocino/Sonoma*** – Reminder to everyone about the non-governmental MAC (municipal advisory councils) meeting on March 7<sup>th</sup>. The Bodega Bay Committee is planning to look at the Caltrans planning document and local coastal program. Two large reserves are getting new coastal trails in Sonoma. Quest Engineering did a large study of the area through Sonoma coastal parks. We should take a look at that document to inform our sediment management plan.

Reminder that Coastwalk (California Coastal Trail Association, or CCTA) has multi-day coastal hikes for adults and families. More info is available at coastwalk.org.

California Coastal Cleanup Day is September 21<sup>st</sup>. The Sonoma Coast Marathon is being planned for the following week along 22 miles of Highway 1. There is some concern about the marathon's proximity to the sanctuary and about the amount of trash and debris (for example, water bottles) that can be generated from large marathons. As well as how quickly the planning process has moved forward for this marathon in particular. There are also public access and safety issues around the lane closures in this area.

Maria suggested connecting Cea to the Presidio Trust (Gene Frazier) regarding this topic. The Presidio Trust has many years of experience hosting running events in a coastal national park. Josh Russo suggested writing a letter to the organizers of the event asking them to forward their plan for trash reduction and disposal, and remind them of sanctuary regulations against anything entering the sanctuary.

**Cea recommended the sanctuary send a letter to Sonoma Coast Marathon organizers requesting information about the mitigation plans and informing them of sanctuary regulations around marine debris and low overflights that may impact wildlife.**

***Nancy Trissel, Community at Large Mendocino/Sonoma*** – Friends of Gualala River (FoGR) and their allies encouraged public letters be sent to CAL FIRE by 2/21/2019 requesting the timber harvest plan known as Dogwood, on the Gualala River, be elevated to review by CAL FIRE Headquarters and the Board of Forestry. More background: <http://gualalariver.org/>.

Dogwood has been found twice to fail to meet California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requirements for failing to evaluate project alternatives with less environmental impact. Dogwood III is just as flawed as its predecessors. It lacks even the most basic survey information on seasonal wetlands – the floodplain of the Gualala River. It also lacks scientific information on rare plants and protected wildlife species such as steelhead trout. The Dogwood III Timber Harvesting Plan has been posted and letters from the public were requested. No changes to the mitigation plan so far and the issue is ongoing. Friends of Gualala River (FoGR) have the plan online for the sanctuary to review.

**Suggestion to have a quick presentation about this issue at a future SAC meeting.**

***Francesca Koe, Conservation*** – The Greater Farallones Association (GFA) approved an initiation of a “protect the waters of the golden gate” (aka, close the donut hole) campaign to build public support for the protection of those waters just outside the San Francisco Bay. A goal of the campaign is to raise public awareness of the issue; and a benefit will be that if there is an opportunity for the sanctuary to take action to include this area in the sanctuary, the public support will be informed.

Francesca will be in Washington, DC on behalf of the Greater Farallones Association the week of March 12-14<sup>th</sup> as part of the National Marine Sanctuary Foundation “fly-in trip” where sanctuary associations throughout the system go to Congress and talk about the benefits of our marine sanctuaries.

April 15<sup>th</sup> there will be an in-person KELPRR (Kelp Ecosystem Landscape Partnership for Restoration and Recovery) meeting with CDFW (California Department of Fish and Wildlife). Francesca is going to send out information once the meeting details are finalized.

There is a new Interim Executive Director for GFA (Louise Franklin). A huge thank you to Bob Wilson for being the temporary Executive Director for two years.

***Elizabeth Babcock, Education*** – The California Academy of Sciences Executive Director stepped down a while back. There is an interim director in place but they are seeking a new director through the Russell Reynold recruitment firm. They are hoping to have a new director by the summer.

The Giants of Land and Sea exhibit is open at the Academy. Later this year, they are doing a natural history of skin exhibit and a dinosaur exhibit. They are piloting (through Think Design and Conservation International) a virtual reality exhibit about oceans and ocean health. Tony Thurman is the new state superintendent and people are working to keep the ocean on his agenda.

***Richard Charter, Conservation*** – The Bureau of Ocean Energy Management final 5-year leasing plan to look at offshore drilling at six locations along our coast, as well as other US coastal locations, should be out in March. There will be a hearing about North Carolina’s Outer Banks in April. Richard doesn’t know what’s happening with the mid-Atlantic, but expects a lot of controversy around the incidental harassment permits for seismic testing issued for that area. The Gulf of Mexico will likely be open again. He doesn’t know what is going to happen with the West Coast. He thinks the offshore wind plans will be limited to

Southern California. There will be hearings coming up in California. Offshore wind industry conference will be in San Francisco the first week of June. This could be a great way to learn about offshore wind industry and impacts. American Wind Energy Association is currently holding a registration for the conference. Richard recommends people attend to learn.

Related to this is Rigs to Reefs, an organization that transforms spent offshore oil rigs into reefs, has worked on 29 oil rigs, mostly near Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary.

**Abby Mohan, Maritime Activities Recreation** – No report.

**Josh Russo, Maritime Activities Recreation** – The KELPRR working group (separate from the SAC kelp recovery working group) objective is to create a commercial fishing industry for urchins. Recreational divers will not be sufficient to clear this large area of urchins. The first step is proof of concept. Through the two charities Josh is president of, they raised \$130,000 to fund the initial project steps. They paid 9 commercial boats and divers cleared four coves of urchins in Mendocino and Sonoma. There have also been public cleanups every other month to clear urchins. The next event is on March 9th. Divers use a basket to bag method and vacuum-like devices that increase productivity of harvest, which could be an option in the future. The research shows that if a cove is cleared and kept clear, the kelp will return and proliferate (disease and continuous rough waters are the only factors known to keep them clear of urchins naturally).

PBS is doing a six-part special for Earth Day. Each episode talks about a different ocean project in California. The KELPRR project is being featured on one of the episodes.

Many legislators are anxiously waiting for the Greater Farallones Association recovery plan based on the SAC recommendations, which will help with getting funding for future recommendations to address this issue. The next step is to get funding to jumpstart the commercial fishery for two years and create a commercial fishery. Related to this is a company Urchinomics (Josh and others will be touring their facilities), who raise urchins (feeding them proprietary food that helps them grow efficiently) so they can have a viable food product and create a market for urchins (as “uni”).

**Ben Becker, National Parks Service** – Elephant seals have moved into the area around Drakes Beach Visitor Center. This year, 60 pups were born. The Parks Service has 7-10 docents there each weekend and 800-1,000 visitors a day. The long term plan is to address the issues of use versus access versus safety. The population of elephant seals is increasing about 8% each year – around 1,200 pups born each year just along Point Reyes National Seashore (PRNS).

PRNS Association in partnership with other associations is running a series of marine grants targeted at education and students (\$4,000-5,000).

Ben is working with University of California at Santa Cruz researchers who do a lot of intertidal modeling to analyze data and look at community changes over time in relation to El Nino events and ocean conditions.

PRNS, Golden Gate National Recreation Area, and Channel Islands National Park are starting a 3-year study to look into endangered black abalone recruitment.

**Jaime Jahncke, Research** – Notes in respect to Ben’s member report and discussion of elephant seals at Drakes Beach that the population of elephant seals is declining on the Farallon Islands.

Point Blue submitted comments on the NOAA Blue Whale Recovery Plan (BLWH) and the 2018 Pacific Marine Mammal Stock Assessment Reports. The BLWH recovery plan hints toward the possible delisting

of blue whales, as they are considered close to recovered. Point Blue testified at a hearing of the California Joint Committee on Fisheries and Aquaculture presenting work on ship strikes and entanglement risk in the sanctuary region.

Data for the Farallon Islands (collaboration with USFWS) and ACCESS (collaboration with NMS) are becoming available on the NOAA Integrated Ecosystem Assessment, the technical report sent to the Pacific Management Fisheries Service, and also available in the CeNCOOS data portal, working to expand data availability and collaborations by using some of their data sharing tools.

Jaime presented at the CBNMS Advisory Council meeting in November on Point Blue's work to reduce ship strikes to whales. He is interested in doing a webinar to share results with Farallones SAC members. Jaime would like to include Pt. Blue's information during the joint meeting with MBNMS in August in Half Moon Bay. Dan can invite CBNMS AC.

John Largier suggested setting up a webinar to discuss information like ACCESS data. In lieu of a short update during a meeting, SAC could host a longer webinar on the topic.

***Dominique Richard, Community at Large Marin/Sonoma*** – There was a loss of Beach Watch data due to the inability to conduct survey on National Park beaches because of Government shutdown in January (a total of at least 8 surveys). Most affected were Drakes beach East & West and possibly Limantour and Point Reyes beach.

Drakes Beach February surveys were also affected by the Elephant Seals intrusion on the beach (ironically facilitated by the shutdown). This situation will likely be repeated in future years because the females develop fidelity to sites where they give birth thereby identifying the site as a "nursery". For the sake of the record continuity of the beach thus affected, the sanctuary should consider collaboration with the park to develop specific training and/or procedures to allow surveyors to proceed even when the elephant seals are present.

One silver lining to this state of affairs: more people were able to see the elephant seals up-close and learn about their ecology when interacting with docents who took care of keeping the elephant seals within the confine of a protected area (which includes part of the parking lot!)

Audubon Canyon Ranch Cypress Grove: Dominique volunteered to participate in the water bird count on Tomales Bay organized by the Cypress Grove staff of Audubon Canyon Ranch (ACR). Unfortunately, the weather did not cooperate and the surveys were cancelled. As a consolation prize, he was invited to a birthday party scheduled in honor of Nils Warnock, director of conservation science at ACR. He briefly met Nils and discussed the mission of Audubon Canyon Ranch promising to contact him later to be better prepared to identify possible collaboration with the Sanctuary.

Tomales Bay Watershed Council (TBWC): As reported earlier, the Tomales Bay Watershed Council was recently reactivated and as part of this evolution Dominique was called to be a member of its executive committee. The TBWC is presently trying to improve budget and accounting to help better manage the organization and develop project plans focused on its original mission of removing the impaired status declared by Regional Water Quality Control Board under section 303d of the Clean Water Act. TBWC is currently limited to recording fecal coliform, pH, and turbidity for 21 sites on a monthly basis and, in addition, conducts two 5-week surveys of these sites to gain more data granularity during the winter (a proxy for "first flush") and summer.

West Marin Chamber of Commerce: Following discussions Dominique had with Cea and Jenn during the last phone meeting of the Tourism subcommittee, Dominique contacted the director of the West Marin

Chamber of Commerce to understand its role and position regarding the recent increase in Twitter & selfie induced tourism in the area and explore possibilities to better promote the sanctuary in its area of responsibility.

**John Largier, Research** – A marine heat waves paper discussing differences in species seen since the 2014-2015 heat wave is coming out soon. John is working on sea level rise and projected flooding as part of CENCOOS plume tracker to see where the water is going once it leaves the San Francisco Bay (mostly moves north). The goal is to set it up as a tool in real time so people can see where the water is moving. PBS Cordell Bank documentary is coming out this summer and John will let everyone know the date once it is available (John and Jaime were involved with the film).

**Bruce Bowser, Conservation** – *Not present at the meeting, but provided a written member's report to be included:*

Bolinas Lagoon fared pretty well through the last series of storms. There was manageable flooding on Hwy 1. Some local stream flooding at the Wye, from Lewis Creek and at the School from Pine Gulch Creek, vehicle control and diversion were practiced by emergency personnel, thus minimizing the introduction of auto pollutants into the Lagoon.

There is still great interest in keeping the College of Marin, Bolinas Marine Lab open as an education facility. The Trustees of College of Marin have hired an architectural firm to estimate renovation costs for the main structures and will maintain the publically utilized and very essential dock.

The Environmental Action Committee of West Marin, (EAC) led MPA Watch Field Training at Limantour Beach, PRNS, was unfortunately rained out Saturday, February 16th, but is being rescheduled for mid-March. A part of the training includes an introduction to California's Network of Marine Protected Areas.

Hog Island Oyster Co., Tomales Bay's largest grower fared well with a Coastal Commission note of compliance for their existing leases, some mitigation measures but a green light to significantly expand their area of cultivation. EAC worked directly with Hog Island and Commission staff to review new leases and helped to preserve about 1.2 acres of habitat that overlapped with NOAA mapped eelgrass beds.

### ***Additional Comments***

John requests that Alayne remind members to write and submit their written member reports prior to the meeting so they can be inserted into the notes for the day.

Alayne is going to re-send the previous meeting notes and Superintendents Report along with the meeting agenda one week prior to meetings, so people can review prior to the meeting (Dominique and Cea really appreciated getting the notes in advance).

### **Presentation: Bolinas Lagoon South End Living Shorelines project: Implementing SAC Recommendations**

Kate Bimrose, GFNMS Affiliate, Bolinas Restoration Program Manager

[Presentation available here.](#)

Kate discussed the plan to address erosion and flooding along the southern end of Bolinas Lagoon through living shoreline projects. The project is looking at two locations along Dipsea Road (Seadrift) and Calle del Arroyo Road (Stinson) to help the area adapt to sea level rise, reduce flooding and erosion

intensity, produce escape refugia/transitional habitat for plants and animals, and protect nearby roads and infrastructure.

Josh asked how the proposal to improve the city street would come through the Greater Farallones Association. Kate answered that the areas impacted are along the shoreline between sanctuary jurisdiction and either Seadrift property or Marin County Open space property. The sanctuary is taking the lead in addressing the impacts through living shorelines techniques (e.g. sloped transitional habitat, or building up of wetlands) within the sanctuary boundary. If work will need to be completed on any of the adjacent roads, then Marin County Department of Public Works (DPW) would be the lead on that work.

Maria indicated that a locally preferred plan from the Sanctuary Advisory Council includes creating transitional habitat. GFA is proposing to create transitional habitat to provide habitat for wildlife and plants to migrate inshore as sea level rises. The sanctuary would be involved in consulting on this project and potentially permitting actions.

Richard indicated that the Caltrans report does not discuss adaptation or living shorelines. It seems like the Bolinas Lagoon program is building a model for living shorelines and maybe Caltrans can look to this as a model.

Kate remarked that the Bolinas Lagoon Restoration Program is working with the Coastal Conservancy and San Francisco National Estuarine Research Reserve on a living shorelines (LS) workshop planned for April 2nd. Practitioners that may be involved in LS projects are invited. Caltrans is included. The National Park Service will be included as well. A webpage will be created to house the different presentations and resources discussed at the workshop. Kate can provide this link and more information to the Advisory Council.

Francesca to Maria: One example of a non-living shoreline nightmare is south of Pillar Point Harbor, along Surfer's Beach (San Mateo Harbor). What is the status of that? Maria indicates that this is an example of how the sanctuary is trying to "soften" shorelines instead of harden. The sanctuary has met extensively with MBNMS and West Coast Region staff. MBNMS will be proposing a regulatory change to allow beneficial reuse of sediment.

Max Delany added that the San Mateo Harbor pilot project to place material above mean high water has funding and they are working on how much material to place.

John Largier added that GFNMS and GFA are catalysts bringing the community into the discussion. Projects should further sanctuary priorities. We have a great legacy in Bolinas Lagoon.

***BREAK***

**Presentation: MBNMS Advisory Council Response to GFNMS Advisory Council MPWC Zone 1 and 5 Recommendation**

Max Delany, GFNMS Staff

[Presentation available here.](#)

Zone 1 is inside Half Moon Bay next to Pillar Point Harbor and is open year round for motorized personal watercraft (MPWC) use. The Farallones sanctuary analyzed and presented Beach Watch data from the last four years on MPWC use of Zone 1 at the August 2018 Advisory Council meeting in Half Moon Bay. Surveyors recorded one MPWC used by an enforcement entity during the four years. Based on the data presented the GFNMS AC recommended closing Zone 1, because of the lack of use.

Zone 5 near Mavericks surf break is only open December through February. The GFNMS AC recommended changing MBNMS regulations to allow MPWC in Zone 5 during a high surf advisory (instead of high surf warning). Beach Watch data was used to assess annual wildlife sightings in this area – there are considerably more sightings when the zone is closed (March-Nov) than when the zone is open (Dec – Feb).

Max reported that the MBNMS AC rejected the GFNMS AC recommendation to remove Zone 1 requesting additional input from the public. The MBNMS AC is concerned about losing a recreational use area and suggested investigating technological solutions for enforcement of Zone 1 instead of buoys.

MBNMS is currently preparing a MPWC Action Plan update as part of the management plan review. The management plan review process includes a public comment period.

Discussion followed Max’s presentation including the suggestion from Josh Russo to have Zone 1 only open when Zone 5 is closed and vice versa.

**MOTION:** Elizabeth moves for a resolution to address GFNMS AC’s desire for changes to these zones.

Resolution to read: “The Council recommends that the Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary include in the updated draft Management Plan alternative motorized personal watercraft (MPWC) regulatory options for Zones 1 and 5 off Pillar Point Harbor. These alternatives should include but are not limited to: 1) From December–February MPWC are permitted in Zone 5 during surf advisory days only and permitted in Zone 1 during non-surf advisory days; from March–November Zone 1 is open and Zone 5 is closed, and; 2) permanently close Zone 1.”

**Francesca seconds**

**All in favor, no opposed, none abstained**

**Motion passed**

**Presentation: Rapid MPR Assessment results**

Maria Brown, GFNMS Staff, Sanctuary Superintendent

[Presentation available here.](#)

Maria presented on the results from the Rapid Management Review assessment. She discussed the difference between a comprehensive versus “rapid” management plan review process.

GFNMS has 11 action plans in the following topics: water quality, wildlife disturbance, introduced species, ecosystem protection: impacts from fishing activities, impacts from vessel spills, education and outreach, conservation science, resource protection, administration and operations as well as the following action plans that crosscut across all three sanctuaries (MB, CB, GF) communication and outreach, ecosystem monitoring, and maritime heritage. Each action plan has related strategies and activities embedded within it.

In four years, GFNMS has completed 80% of the activities listed in the Management Plan, whether in process, completed, or ongoing. The next step in the management plan review process is to complete a condition report in 2021 and based on the condition report review the Management Plan again in 2023.

Members request that Maria share the 10-page memo sent to the West Coast Region Director.

**MOTION: Richard moves that the Council commends the work of GFNMS in implementing the Management Plan and secondly, supports continuing implementation of the management plan.**

**Abby seconds**

**All in favor, no opposed, none abstained**  
**Motion passed**

Members request the resolution be sent to the West Coast Region Director and to ONMS leadership.

ADJOURN at 4:15PM