



GREATER FARALLONES & CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARIES
JOINT ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING
9:00am – 4:30pm PT
Hybrid Meeting
Dance Palace Community and Cultural Center and Google Meet

MEETING HIGHLIGHTS

Note: The following notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS), Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS), or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

To view slides from any presentation referenced in this document, please email tishma.patel@noaa.gov.

GFNMS Advisory Council Business

GFNMS Advisory Council (GFNMS AC) Vice Chair Bibit Traut welcomed all to the meeting and called roll for the council. See Appendix I for GFNMS AC attendance record for this meeting.

Tishma informed the council that the annual retreat will take place in October; looking for ideas for locations/ideas for activities.

The council then approved the draft meeting highlights from the April 2023 council meeting. Conservation member Kathi George motioned to approve the highlights and Community-at-Large (CAL) San Francisco-San Mateo member Barton Selby seconded.

GFNMS AC MOTION: Approve February Meeting Highlights

Vote: 10 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

A copy of the meeting highlights is available upon request to tishma.patel@noaa.gov, and will be posted online at <https://cordellbank.noaa.gov/council/documents.html>.

GFNMS Advisory Council Member and Alternate Reports

Council members and alternates shared reports from their constituencies.

- Bibit Traut, Education Member
 - Recently seen bald eagle on Tomales Bay
 - Maybe a paddle board event for retreat or GIYS event
 - College of Marin Bolinas field station opening soon
 - Attending Sanctuary Advisory Council (SAC) Chairs and Coordinators meeting at end of September in upstate New York; let her know if anything you want her to bring up
- Jacqueline Moore, Maritime Activities Member

- Busy time; vessel carriers participating in VSR programs
 - We're seeing greater compliance
- Abby Mohan, California Natural Resource Agency (CNRA) alternate
 - No longer Maritime Recreation Member, now in CNRA seat as alternate
 - 30x30 program manager now
- Bart Selby, CAL SF/SM Member
 - Windy few months; there has been less human presence recently
 - Likely many whales
- George Clyde, CAL Marin Member
 - New non-native invasive species in Tomales Bay; invasive sea anemone native to Australia, New Zealand, and Chile; first report in North America; likely already abundant in Tomales Bay
- Richard James, CAL Marin Alternate
 - At mouth of Russian River, tons of pelicans and at least 500 harbor seals; Sonoma County Sheriff helicopter flew at about 200-300 ft and flushed pelicans
 - Abandoned oyster racks in Tomales Bay from 1980s; about 5 ft long by 2 ft wide; working with NOAA restoration center to get removed
 - Abandoned tires at Marconi Boat Ramp
 - Next week, Sonoma County voting on Fort Ross Pumped Storage Project plan and language around dredged materials is problematic
- Gerry McChesney, US Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) Alternate
 - ~450,000 seabirds on Farallones Islands; Point Blue Conservation Science has been monitoring; decent seabird breeding season so far; El Nino may be starting to show at islands
 - Pinniped numbers increasing steadily; surpassed over a 1,000 CA sea lions born; Stellar sea lions had about 80 pups
 - Need to replace moorings at island in September; shared ownership with GFNMS; permit application to get through
- Dick Ogg, Commercial Fishing Alternate
 - Salmon fishery closed
 - Seeing thousands of tiny pyrosomes offshore; impact ability to fish; this usually is an indicator of warm ocean water that is farther away from us (not where we fish); our water temperature has been a bit below normal, unsure if warm water is going to move in
 - Domoic Acid problem in Southern CA
- Craig Kenkel, National Park Service Member
 - Eelgrass surveying in Drake's Estero this week
 - In September, going in front of CA Coastal Commission to present water quality report
- Kathi George, Conservation Member
 - No domoic acid cases at The Marine Mammal Center yet
 - 1 entangled gray whale in San Francisco Bay in June
 - 2 dead gray whale whales in June; Cause of death undetermined
 - Lots of whales offshore
 - Chairing Harbor Safety Committee Working Group to investigate reducing ship strikes within SF Bay/Pacifica exclusion zone; Jess Morten is also involved

- Sarah Bates, Fishing Member
 - Salmon fishery closed
 - Mostly working on hatchery proposals
- Mary Miller, Education Alternate
 - Exploratorium hosting evening event on ocean acidification on 8/17 – will send blurb
- Jaime Jahncke, Research Member
 - La Jolla meeting focused on California Current report

Tishma informed the council that recruitment would be taking place in early August

CBNMS Advisory Council Arrive and Roll Call

CBNMS Advisory Council (CBNMS AC) Vice Chair Steve Tubbs welcomed all to the meeting and called roll for the council.

See Appendix II for CBNMS AC attendance record for this meeting.

GFNMS and CBNMS Superintendent's Report

Maria Brown, Superintendent of GFNMS and CBNMS, provided updates on GFNMS and CBNMS Operations, Research, Education/Outreach, and Resource Protection program activities since the last council meeting in February.

Highlights included 1) \$2 million in IRA funds for converting shop garage on Crissy Field into ocean learning center, 2) working on GIS tool for coral restoration, 3) publishing of the CBNMS Condition Report, 4) science team conducting ACCESS cruises, 4) kelp restoration research cruise in Drake's Bay, 5) education program number updates, and 6) recent GFNMS/MBNMS engagement with the Pacific Fishery Management Council regarding deep sea coral restoration.

Maria highlighted recent permit applications received, permits issued, and permits under review. Kai Martin asked which permits correspond to each sanctuary.

Bart Selby inquired if permit applications are required to detail impacts to sanctuary resources. Maria responded that they are required to do so.

Dick Ogg inquired why weather buoys need to get permits. Maria responded that NOAA has to apply for permits, because they are technically breaking sanctuary regulations via disturbance to the seabed. Lilli added that the current permit application is to extend the current permit period.

Abby Mohan mentioned that a summary of kelp restoration lessons learned would be good to document and disseminate. Maria mentioned that we can do that.

Dick Ogg inquired about urchin removal activities. Maria informed Dick that the kelp team is investigating the best methods to control urchin populations and monitor site restoration site.

Max Delaney provided the response and enforcement report. Since the last meeting, three incidents occurred in the sanctuary. Richard James asked if the sanctuary or NOAA has any plans to communicate these outcomes versus uninsured vessel incidents. Max informed Richard that

there is an opportunity to spread the word via the working groups and committees the sanctuary sits on. Maria added that the ACCould add a recommendation to the Open Ocean recommendations to be covered later in the agenda.

George Clyde inquired about the vessel American Challenger and asked for an update. Max highlighted that there are still agency resources going into the enforcement and removal of the vessel.

Bart Selby mentioned that every day thousands of 2 lb lead fishing weights/anchors litter the CA coastline. Maria mentioned that we can not regulate those activities because it is deemed lawful fishing activities, and the council could provide recommendations to address this concern today.

Maria mentioned that our next meeting will be a joint retreat in October and solicited ideas for the retreat. Bibit recommended that examining phase shifts could be fruitful. Wind energy as a topic was also brought up; this topic was seconded by Jacqueline Moore. Kathi George mentioned learning how the State's 30x30 efforts will intersect with the sanctuary would be valuable. Jenny Stock mentioned that the Cordell Bank Virtual Reality could be incorporated into the retreat. Abby mentioned that getting out to see the kelp restoration sites would be great. Sea otter reintroduction and deep sea corals were also mentioned as potential topics.

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Superintendent's Report

Lisa Wooninck, Superintendent of Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS), provided a brief report on recent and upcoming events at the sanctuary.

Highlights included 1) Inflation Reduction Act funding updates which include \$7 million to create new MBNMS offices at California State University Monterey Bay, 2) Bipartisan Infrastructure Law funding updates including marine debris removal along the west coast sanctuaries, 3) the redesign of new signage and installation of over 40 new signs, 4) sea otter outreach efforts regarding increased sea otter presence in the Monterey Bay due to winter storms, and 5) new species discovered within MBNMS

Public Comment

Michael Newman: Comment regarding having the entire coast as a National Marine Sanctuary

George Clyde: USFWS reports on sea otter reintroduction highlight impacts to fishing industry from reintroduction. Tourism is a concern that must be mitigated if sea otters are to be introduced.

Eileen Boken: Comment regarding kelp forest reforestation and sea otter reintroduction as topics to be discussed by the California Coastal Commission.

Jeff Loomans: Support for AB953 letter and thanks for all the work on kelp restoration

Action item: Open Ocean Environment

GFNMS/CBNMS staff provided a comprehensive presentation on Open Ocean Environment work that has taken place since the last management plan review in 2014. The presentations included information on resource protection, conservation science, and education activities as well as staff recommendations for activities for the next management plan.

Following the presentations, the councils engaged in a discussion with sanctuary staff.

Abby Mohan inquired how settlement funds like those received from the cruise ship discharge are used. Maria responded that funds must go towards restoring the sanctuary.

Bart Selby asked if the Ocean Currents radio show would be coming back? Jenny informed Bart that this could be a recommendation from the advisory council.

Bibit Traut asked if there were any efforts to expand US Coast Guard presence north of Bodega Bay to increase response efficiency in the Open Ocean.

Dick Ogg proposed that commercial fishermen could be useful in collecting real time hypoxia data and inquired if there was a way to make this happen.

Mary Miller asked the best way to provide advice on topic briefings. Maria responded that the council can give recommendations today if it feels like they have a good sense for recommendations. The council could also delve deeper and stand up a working group to explore issues/topics in more depth. Both options are open to the council.

Kai Martin asked if greenhouse gas emissions monitoring was occurring at the site level or the national level. Brian mentioned that it began at the site level and it is currently a national level effort.

Kai Martin also asked if this is the appropriate time to recommend that the SF/Pacifica Exclusion Zone be integrated into the sanctuary system. Maria responded that now is an appropriate time.

Richard James suggested that the sanctuary estimate how much taxpayer dollars are used to salvage uninsured vessels within the sanctuary. He also suggested the sanctuary strategically place “ambassadors” at boat ramps and other entry points into the sanctuary (and collaborate with agencies and partners) in order to better educate the public on sanctuary regulations.

Morgan Patton mentioned that the statewide MPA Collaborative can help with community outreach.

Following discussion, the councils made edits and additions to staff recommendations. GFNMS Advisory Council California Natural Resources Agency member Abby Mohan motioned to support the staff recommendations with Sanctuary Advisory Council edits.

CBNMS Advisory Council Maritime Activities member Kai Martin seconded.

CBNMS AC MOTION: To support recommendations for Open Ocean Environment

Vote: 4 yes, 0 no, 0 abstention. There was not a quorum and the council will need to vote again at the next AC meeting.

To view the recommendations within the topic briefing, please visit <https://cordellbank.noaa.gov/council/actions.html>.

GFNMS AC MOTION: To support recommendations for Open Ocean Environment
Vote: 10 yes, 0 no, 0 abstention. The recommendations will be forwarded to the sanctuary.

To view the recommendations within the topic briefing, please visit https://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/sac_actions.html.

Action item: GFNMS AC and CBNMS AC Letter of Support for Proposed Designation of a National Marine Sanctuary for Lake Erie

The councils discussed and provided edits to a draft letter of support for the Proposed Designation of a National Marine Sanctuary for Lake Erie prepared by GFNMS AC Vice Chair Bibit Traut. GFNMS Advisory Council Conservation member Kathi George motioned to approve the letter. CBNMS Advisory Council Maritime Activities member Kai Martin seconded.

CBNMS AC MOTION: Approve Joint Letter of Support for the Proposed Designation of a National Marine Sanctuary for Lake Erie
Vote: 4 yes, 0 no, 0 abstention. There was not a quorum and the council will need to vote again at the next AC meeting.

GFNMS AC MOTION: Approve Joint Letter of Support for the Proposed Designation of a National Marine Sanctuary for Lake Erie
Vote: 10 yes, 0 no, 0 abstention. The recommendations will be forwarded to the sanctuary.

Action item: GFNMS AC and CBNMS AC Letter of Support for California Assembly Bill 953 to Reduce Vessel Speed to Protect Whales

The councils discussed and provided edits to a draft letter of support for California Assembly Bill 953 to Reduce Vessel Speed to Protect Whales prepared by CBNMS AC Chair Jeffrey Dorman.

Jacqueline Moore mentioned that the bill will next be heard by the Senate Appropriations Committee and can provide the correct address.

George Clyde mentioned that Assemblymember Damon Connolly sponsored the bill and noted that he should be cc'd on the bill.

GFNMS Advisory Council Maritime Commercial Activities member Jacqueline Moore motions to approve the letter. GFNMS Advisory Council Research member Jaime Jahncke seconded.

CBNMS AC MOTION: Approve Joint Letter of Support for California Assembly Bill 953 to Reduce Vessel Speed to Protect Whales

Votes: 5 yes, 0 no, 0 abstentions. Advisory Council Chair Jeffrey Dorman provided his vote via email. The recommendations will be forwarded to the sanctuary.

GFNMS AC MOTION: Approve Joint Letter of Support for California Assembly Bill 953 to Reduce Vessel Speed to Protect Whales

Votes: 9 yes, 0 no, 1 abstentions. The recommendations will be forwarded to the sanctuary.

Action item: Preserve Our Maritime History

GFNMS/CBNMS staff provided a comprehensive presentation on work that has taken place since the last management plan review in 2014 regarding preserving our Maritime History. The presentations included information on resource protection, conservation science, and education activities as well as staff recommendations for activities for the next management plan. Following the presentations, the council engaged in discussion with sanctuary staff.

Bibit Traut asked if Tribal culturally important resources along the GFNMS coastline were cataloged and taken into account. Lilli Ferguson mentioned that the sanctuary was not aware of any to date.

Dick Ogg inquired about how sanctuary protections for maritime resources intersect with the pumping project at Fort Ross. Maria mentioned that if there are impacts below the mean high tide mark, then the sanctuary would need to be consulted.

Gerry McChesney mentioned shipwrecks that still have oil and/or fuel and begin to release those pollutants years later should be taken into consideration.

Following discussion, the councils made edits and additions to staff recommendations. The councils motioned to vote on supporting the staff recommendations with Sanctuary Advisory Council edits.

CBNMS AC MOTION: To support recommendations to Preserve Our Maritime History

Votes: 4 yes, 0 no, 0 abstention. There was not a quorum and the council will need to vote again at the next AC meeting.

To view the recommendations within the topic briefing, please visit <https://cordellbank.noaa.gov/council/actions.html>.

GFNMS AC MOTION: To support recommendations to Preserve Our Maritime History

Votes: 7 yes, 0 no, 0 abstention. The recommendations will be forwarded to the sanctuary.

To view the recommendations within the topic briefing, please visit https://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/sac_actions.html.

CBNMS Advisory Council Business

The council approved the draft meeting highlights from the April 2023 council meeting.

CBNMS AC MOTION: Approve April 2023 meeting highlights

Votes: 4 yes, 0 no, 0 abstention. There was not a quorum and the council will need to vote again at the next AC meeting.

Tishma mentioned that the council would need to schedule the Cordell Bank NMS Meeting for later this year to vote on items in which there was not a quorum.

CBNMS AC Member and Alternate Reports

- Steve Tubbs, CAL Sonoma
 - Sharing ocean-related content with followers via social media and leading hikes at Point Reyes National Seashore
- Morgan Patton, Conservation
 - Working on state Decadal MPA review
 - MPA Watch trainings taking place right now
 - Cleaner California Coast campaign ongoing for litter reduction along the coast
- Kai Martin, Maritime Activities
 - Supportive of AB953
 - Tracking offshore wind development
 - Impacts to shipping lanes
 - Investigating shipping industry role in offshore industry
 - North American Marine Environment Protection Association (NAMEPA) engagement on educational outreach program
 - Tracking how zero emissions vessels affect ocean noise
- Chrissy Piotrowski, Research
 - Making historical marine biodiversity data public online
 - Receiving holotypes of new species recently described in MBNMS
 - Mini CBNMS exhibit still on display at Cal Academy

Meeting highlights prepared by Tishma Patel, Advisory Council Coordinator.

Appendix I. GFNMS AC Attendance for the July 2023 GFNMS/CBNMS Advisory Council Meeting. The blue rows are voting members and the purple rows are non-voting members.

Name	Seat	Attendance
Sarah Bates	Commercial Fishing (Member)	Y
Richard Ogg	Commercial Fishing (Alternate)	Y
George Clyde	Community-at-Large Marin (Member)	Y

Richard James	Community-at-Large Marin (Alternate)	Y
Vacant	Community-at-Large Mendocino-Sonoma (Member)	--
Vacant	Community-at-Large Mendocino-Sonoma (Alternate)	--
Bart Selby	Community-at-Large San Francisco-San Mateo (Member)	Y
Vacant	Community-at-Large San Francisco-San Mateo (Alternate)	--
Francesca Koe	Conservation (Member)	N
Kathi George	Conservation (Member)	Y
Vacant	Conservation (Alternate)	--
Vacant	Conservation (Alternate)	--
Bibit Traut	Education (Member)	Y
Mary Miller	Education (Alternate)	Y
Jacqueline Moore	Maritime Commercial Activities (Member)	Y
Vacant	Maritime Commercial Activities (Alternate)	--

Vacant	Maritime Recreational Activities (Member)	
Peter Molnar	Maritime Recreational Activities (Alternate)	N
Jaime Jahncke	Research (Member)	Y
Ellen Hines	Research (Alternate)	N
Vacant	Youth (Member)	--
Vacant	Youth (Alternate)	--
Jenn Eckerle	California Department of Natural Resources (Member)	N
Abby Mohan	California Department of Natural Resources (Alternate)	Y
Craig Kenkel	National Park Service (Member)	Y
Ben Becker	National Park Service (Alternate)	N
LT Lelea Lingo	U.S. Coast Guard (Member)	N
LTJG Andrew Kang	U.S. Coast Guard (Alternate)	N
Matthew Brown	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Member)	N

Gerry McChesney	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Alternate)	Y
Jennifer Boyce	National Marine Fisheries Service (Member)	Y
Vacant	National Marine Fisheries Service (Alternate)	--
Chris Mobley	Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary (Member)	N
Mike Murray	Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary (Alternate)	N
Lisa Wooninck	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Member)	Y
Dawn Hayes	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Alternate)	N

Appendix II. CBNMS AC Attendance for the July 2023 GFNMS/CBNMS Advisory Council Meeting. The blue rows are voting members and the purple rows are non-voting members.

Name	Seat	Attendance
Vacant	Community-at-Large Marin	--
Vacant	Community-at-Large Marin	--
Frank Capurro	Community-at-Large Sonoma	N

Steve Tubbs		Y
Scott Artis	Conservation	N
Morgan Patton	Conservation	Y
Vacant	Education	--
Vacant	Education	--
Chris Ohanian	Fishing	N
Vacant	Fishing	--
Vacant	Maritime Activities	--
Kai Martin	Maritime Activities	Y
Jeff Dorman (Chair)	Research	N
Chrissy Piotrowski	Research	Y
Lisa Wooninck	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Non-voting member)	Y

Dawn Hayes	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Non-voting alternate)	N
LT Kynan Barrios	National Marine Fisheries Service (Non-voting member)	N
Vacant	National Marine Fisheries Service (Non-voting alternate)	--
LT Lelea Lingo	United States Coast Guard (Non-voting member)	N
LTJG Andrew Kang	United States Coast Guard (Non-voting alternate)	N